The Role of Technology as a Facilitator in the Implementation of Quality Assurance Practices for the Future of Transnational Education

Professor Romeela Mohee
Education Specialist, Higher Education
Annegret Wittfoth, Programme Assistant
CANQATE 2019, 22-25 October 2019
COL INITIATIVES

COMMONWEALTH OF LEARNING

- Higher Education
- TVSD
- VUSSC
- Technology Enabled Learning
- Teacher Education
- Open and Innovative Schooling
- Life long learning for Farmers
- Girls Inspire
- Knowledge management

Learning for sustainable development
COL HE initiative is working with Ministries of Education and HE Institutions to increase access to quality tertiary education and improve the livelihoods of graduates through an integrated, activity-based model.
OVERVIEW

- Higher Education trends
- Transnational Education and ODL
- Technology and education - how is technology transforming education
- Quality Assurance in ODL, OER and MOOCs
- Quality Assurance guidelines
HIGHER EDUCATION TRENDS
GROSS ENROLMENT RATIO (TERTIARY EDUCATION) BY REGION

Gross Enrolment rate Tertiary Education (2014)

24% World

25% Caribbean states

Source: UNESCO Institute for statistics data centre, 2017
### GER TERTIARY EDUCATION - CARIBBEAN SMALL STATES (2006 – 2016)

**Source:** UNESCO Institute for Statistics, Retrieved on 12 June 2018.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Secondary (net)</th>
<th>Tertiary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grenada</strong></td>
<td>88% (2018)</td>
<td>96% (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Jamaica</strong></td>
<td>74% (2018)</td>
<td>27% (2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Barbados</strong></td>
<td>94 (2018)</td>
<td>65 (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>St. Lucia</strong></td>
<td>73 (2004)</td>
<td>19% (2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Caribbean small states</strong></td>
<td>74.27% (2018)</td>
<td>23.06% (2016)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** World Bank data
## GER Trends in Higher Education: Sub-Saharan Africa

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GER %</th>
<th>Namibia</th>
<th>Lesotho</th>
<th>Botswana</th>
<th>South Africa</th>
<th>Eswatini</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>M</strong></td>
<td><strong>F</strong></td>
<td><strong>M</strong></td>
<td><strong>F</strong></td>
<td><strong>M</strong></td>
<td><strong>F</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tertiary</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHALLENGES IN HIGHER EDUCATION

- Increased demand for Higher Education
  - Burgeoning youth population
  - Changing Market Forces
- Massification of Higher Education
  - University education has shifted from being the preserve of the elite to a service open to the masses.
- Globalisation
  - Cross border higher education- recognition of qualifications
- Technology Integration
  - Increasing use of the new technologies in higher education and its delivery
- Accountability
  - More Investment in higher education because of its relevance to countries’ socio-economic, sustainable development
DIVERSIFICATION IN HIGHER EDUCATION: NEW PROVIDERS

- Private
- Cross border/Transnational
- Online learning (ODL)
- Dual mode delivery
- Microdegrees

How to assure Quality?
Transnational education also known as cross border education in many cases.

UNESCO and the OECD, in their Guidelines for Quality Provision in Cross-Border Higher Education, state that: 'Cross-border higher education includes higher education that takes place when students follow a course or programme of study that has been produced, and is continuing to be maintained, in a country different from the one in which they are residing. Cross-border higher education may include higher education by private and/or for-profit providers.'
ODL- THE NEW FORM OF TRANSNATIONAL EDUCATION IN THE FOURTH INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION
OPPORTUNITIES

- Through technology
- There is a huge opportunity for HE providers, including cross-border providers, to develop new business models and bring education to millions by using technology and new communication infrastructure especially the mobile phone
- This combination of expanding connectivity and the growing reservoir of open education resources is a revolution
HOW CAN TECHNOLOGY TRANSFORM EDUCATION
BLENDED LEARNING - DEFINITION

Blended learning definition: “integration of face-to-face and online instruction,” (Graham 2013).

Findings from 2018 Study by Dziuban et al.:

- Blended learning maintains or increases access and increases success rates of all students
- Students view blended learning as most effective learning environment
- “The characteristics they view as important relate to clear establishment and progress toward course objectives, creating an effective learning environment and the instructors’ effective communication. If in their view those three elements of a course are satisfied they are virtually guaranteed to evaluate their educational experience as excellent irrespective of most other considerations, (Dziuban et al., 2018)”

Online enrolment increasing in the past two decades in countries like Canada and the United States.

On-campus institutions have become the largest providers of distance education in their countries by becoming providers of online education.

Growth of “dualmode” institutions is happening across the world. For example, the University of Cape Town approved the creation of six online distance education programs, in 2014 with 14 more being planned. University of Namibia enrolled 4000 learners and moving to LLB online.

27 fully fledged Open Universities in the Commonwealth (NOUN, OUM, OUT…).

In 2013, the Open Campus of UWI served nearly 20,000 students from 17 Caribbean countries, 4000 of whom were studying online.

In 2014, over 33.5 per cent of all US HE students were taking at least one online course. Latin America has nearly 15 per cent online enrolments, with Brazil and Colombia registering the highest growth.

Reference: Ambient insight 2016 report
“MOOCs are online courses designed for large numbers of participants, that can be accessed by anyone, anywhere as long as they have an Internet connection, are open to everyone without entry qualifications and offer a full/complete course experience online for free”

- Mulder & Jansen, 2015
OPEN EDUCATION RESOURCES (OER)

Materials that are:
• Free and freely available
• Suitable for all levels
• Reusable
• Digital

Promote quality assurance and peer review of OER. Encourage the development of mechanisms for the assessment and certification of learning outcomes achieved through OER.
– Paris Declaration 2012- UNESCO
INNOVATIONS AND OPPORTUNITIES

- Coursera, EDX, Udacity, FutureLearn models,
- MIT's OpenCourseWare website hosts 2,450 classes and receives 2 million monthly visitors, while edX contains 90 MIT courses-
- Credit transfer from MOOCs in Russia, recognition of MOOC in Malaysia
- 2015: Open Education Project by eight leading universities and 2 leading ones- 200 course in regular university programs. Certificates can be transferred into university credits
- Open textbooks in Canada British Columbia created BC campus (136 open textbooks adapted.)
- Provide online students with scholarships – Penn state
- South Africa open learning group partners with University of the North West

Reference : MAJOR DEVELOPMENTS, CHALLENGES, OPPORTUNITIES IN ONLINE AND DISTANCE EDUCATION, www.contactnorth.ca
BENEFITS OF ODL IN THE WORK PLACE

56% learned skills for current job
38% improved candidacy for a new job
18% started a new career
9% received a promotion or pay raise
8% started a new business
84% of career builders report some kind of career benefit

Reference: https://elearninginfographics.com/people-globally-benefiting-from-online-learning-infographic/
STUDENT IN 2035

Division of Learning: “Maker, Doer, Thinker”

Artificial Intelligence: Holographic Advisor Bot

Advanced Communication: Language translation implants

Micro-courses

Learning at home: Immers-A-Casts

Broadened classrooms & Blended courses: linking of multiple f-f classes via technology (mega-pixel walls)

Reference: BIG SHIFTS ARE COMING! LOOKING BACK FROM 2035 . www.contactnorth.ca
ANAYA IN 2035

- “The blending of online and on-ground classes; group and solitary work; maker, doer and thinker classes provided just the right balance for her. Learning to Learn and they were right.”

- “It would have all been overwhelming without Mr. Yip, her Holographic Advisor Bot (HAB). Mr. Yip helped her understand the Critical Thinking (Critical Thinking) and Design and Engineering Thinking (Year 2) learning goals and navigate the thousands of courses that would satisfy her plan. She now met the rubric and certification standards”.

- “Thank goodness for the implants that made it possible for her to study and participate in many languages. Google’s annual upgrades added new languages every year. Anaya was shocked and rather startled the first time she heard her voice clicking in Swahili in her Understanding Africa course.”

- “After completing her 3-month Foundations immersion, Anaya took 6 microclasses, enough to satisfy a cohort requirement for the Chemistry concentration.”

- “Didactic learning usually could be done at home or at the park via Immers-A-Casts from Apple, Google, Coursera or one of the other College and University Consortia (CUC) partners.”

- “While your class might have only 25 students, three mega-pixel walls linked up to 36 linked classrooms. Student questions from nearly 1,000 students could be sorted, matched or even filtered – in real time – and either answered “live” or on the comprehensive class summaries (CCS) posted soon after then end of class.”

Reference: BIG SHIFTS ARE COMING! LOOKING BACK FROM 2035. www.contactnorth.ca
QA IMPLICATIONS
44 countries have:
- QA Authorities
- HE Councils
- National Accreditation Boards
- Tertiary Councils
- National Commissions/University Commissions
‘Western QA…dominated the spread of country-based efforts….’

‘the shape…of QA was strongly influenced by traditional HE….’ by Judith Eaton, President, CHEA, USA

Dominated by Inputs and Processes
There is a strong drive to build and create knowledge together with an understanding of working life and reformulate the concept of knowledge in learning situations.

The fundamental changes in employment over the past 50 years imply a rise in the demand for non-routine cognitive and interpersonal skills and soft skills.

Graduates are entering a world of employment that is characterized by greater uncertainty, speed, risk, complexity and interdisciplinary working.

University education, and the mode of learning whilst at university, will need to prepare students for entry to such an environment and equip them with appropriate skills, knowledge, values and attributes to thrive in it.

Tighter connections with working life through different academic projects provide authentic opportunities to learn both generic and professional competencies as well as to build networks and pathways for employment after graduation.

“Taking note that 414.2 million students will be enrolled in higher education around the world by 2030 – an increase from 99.4 million in 2000, and that online, open and flexible education is going mainstream, the importance of quality learning outcomes for learners cannot be overestimated.” – Gard Titlestad

ODL FUNCTIONS IN BLENDED LEARNING

Tutorial Support for Learners

Course/Instructional Design

Materials Development

Electronic Media

Counselling, Assessment, & Management

Learning Management Systems
SHOULD QA IN ODL BE SAME AS F2F?
QUALITY ASSURANCE IN ODL VS. F2F

- Should be assured same way but differences as follows:
  - Larger number of stakeholders and specialists in development and delivery
  - Separation of elearner and institution
  - More detailed planning of production and budgets
  - More diverse target audiences
  - Greater use of web and ICTs
  - Different interpretation of what constitutes teaching, a learner based instead of a lecture based
**COMPARISON F2F BLENDED QA - STAFF**

- **Academics**
  - Amount of work underestimated for course development and delivery especially with large groups of students
  - Not recognized in the formal workload nor promotion exercise
  - Equivalence of DE delivery in terms of academic workload

- **Tutors**
  - Often tutors are not permanent staff of university;
  - QA: criteria for recruitment, training, monitoring and payment of contract staff
  - Caution: tutor:learner ratio while academic workload is well defined

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contact</th>
<th>Distance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16 credits =160h/module</td>
<td>16 credits =160h/module</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64 hours reading, thinking and making notes</td>
<td>64 hours reading, thinking and making notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 hours completing and uploading assignments (2/module)</td>
<td>32 hours completing and uploading assignments (2/module)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 hours preparing for summative assessment</td>
<td>16 hours preparing for summative assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5 hours contact tutorials (7 x 1.5)</td>
<td>48 hours self-assessment, peer cooperation and collaboration (16w x &lt;3h)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e.g., &lt;0.5 hours intro activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;1 hour quiz on new content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;1.5 hour consolidation discussion/feedback</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Model Used at University of Pretoria
ORGANISATIONAL CHALLENGES

- **Administrative support**
  - DE programs require more admin support than F2F programs
  - Decentralized registration of learners, materials production, dispatch, maintenance of information management systems, assignment management, etc.
  - Difficult to subcontract as fully integrated in the system
  - How to assign a workload

- Dropouts or inactive learners

- Real costs of a DE programme based on completed graduates

- Understanding your target audience; varying context

- Building a learner profile - can be very diverse
Functions of ODL

- Course design
- Instructional design
- Course materials development
- Electronic media use
- LMS
- Tutorial support for learners
- Monitoring of tutors
- Counselling, assessment and management

(adapted from COL & ADB, 1999)
QA RUBRICS FOR ODL

1. Programme Design
2. Learner Support Systems
3. Materials Development
4. Student Assessment
5. Infrastructure and Facilities
6. Staffing
7. Open and Distance Education Systems and Structures
QA IN OER

- Who is responsible for the quality of repurposed content?
- How do institutions ensure the integrity of content?
- What is the role of QA agencies?
QA IN MOOC

- Can one size fit all?
- Student verification and academic integrity
- Is a peer reviewed assessment acceptable?
- Is there a delinking of the institutions which teach and the institutions which credential?
- What will be the role of accreditation?

4 sets of guidelines
Institutions
Governments,
Learners,
Accreditation agencies
COL RESOURCES
ON QUALITY ASSURANCE

http://oasis.col.org/
QUALITY TOOLS...

- Quality rubrics
- Quality guidelines
- COL/RIM
- Quality audits
## ON QUALITY ASSURANCE...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Publication Date</th>
<th>Handle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality Assurance: Good Practices in ODL in Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>2019-4</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/3132">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/3132</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Regional Community of Practice (CoP) Quality Assurance Guidelines in Open and Distance Learning (ODL)</td>
<td>2019-3</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/3126">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/3126</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating Employability in Higher Education Institutions: An Introduction to the Commonwealth of Learning’s Employability Model for Prospective Partners</td>
<td>2019-3</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/3123">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/3123</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidelines for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of MOOCs</td>
<td>2016-7</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2362">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2362</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# QA Toolkits and Guidelines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Publication Date</th>
<th>Handle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality Assurance Toolkit: Distance Education Institutions and Programmes</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/105">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/105</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Commonwealth of Learning Review and Improvement Model for Higher Education Institutions</td>
<td>2014-6</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/602">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/602</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Review Toolkit for ODL and eLearning Courses</td>
<td>2016-4</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2338">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2338</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidelines for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of MOOCs</td>
<td>2016-7</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2362">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2362</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality Assurance Guidelines for Open Educational Resources: TIPS Framework</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/562">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/562</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality Assurance in Open and Distance Learning: Trainers' Kit</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/104">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/104</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### REPORTS AND PAPERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Publication Date</th>
<th>Handle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Open and Distance Learning Quality Assurance in Commonwealth</td>
<td>2016-2</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2046">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2046</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universities: A Report and Recommendations for QA and Accreditation Agencies and Higher Education Institutions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Adapting Quality Assurance to Innovative Programmes (PCF8)</td>
<td>2016-11</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2638">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2638</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Delivery of Open and Distance Learning in Kenya: Demand and</td>
<td>2016-11</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2683">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2683</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality Concerns (PCF8)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Towards a Culture of Quality</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/119">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/119</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Quality in MOOCs: Surveying the Terrain</td>
<td>2016-6</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2352">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/2352</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Quality Assurance in Higher Education: An Introduction</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/101">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/101</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Quality Assurance in Higher Education: Selected Case Studies</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td><a href="http://hdl.handle.net/11599/102">http://hdl.handle.net/11599/102</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONCLUSION

- With the explosion of systems because of expanding connectivity and Open Educational Resources, there is a stronger need for quality assurance.
- Exchanging information among a wide range of stakeholders is a good foundation for capacity-building. It also empowers learners and promotes quality 'literacy' when it is shared with students, employers and parents.
- Data-bases, publications, knowledge repositories for decision-makers on policy issues in higher education, and electronic forums to promote communities of interest in QA and QR are all part of the process.
- The policy debates they generate encourage the dialogue across borders that is a prerequisite for the solid international frameworks of quality assurance that can be catalysts of change.
- Integrate employability in Quality Assurance frameworks.