Technical & Vocational Skills Development

Monitoring and Evaluation Report

C15-261

March 2015

Shafika Isaacs
## CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ................................................................................................................................. 3  
LIST OF FIGURES .......................................................................................................................................... 4  
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS .............................................................................................................................. 5  
1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ................................................................................................................................. 6  
2. INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................................................ 12  
3. CONTEXT AND BACKGROUND .................................................................................................................... 12  
4. EVALUATION FRAMEWORK AND METHODOLOGY ..................................................................................... 17  
   4.1 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .................................................................................................................... 18  
   4.2 LIMITATIONS ............................................................................................................................................. 18  
   4.3 COSTS OF MONITORING AND EVALUATION ............................................................................................. 19  
5. FINDINGS ......................................................................................................................................................... 21  
6. ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS ............................................................................................................................. 49  
   6.2 EFFICIENCY: How cost-effective has INVEST Africa been? .................................................................. 55  
   6.3 How RELEVANT is the TVSD Initiative for its partner institutions? ....................................................... 55  
   6.4 How SUSTAINABLE is the TVSD Initiative for COL Partners? ................................................................. 55  
   6.5 GENDER EQUALITY: To what extent has TVSD Initiative promoted gender equality? ......................... 56  
7. CONCLUSION .................................................................................................................................................... 58  
   7.1 STRENGTHS ............................................................................................................................................... 58  
8. RECOMMENDATIONS ................................................................................................................................... 58  
   8.1 RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO THE TVSD INITIATIVE INPUTS AND ACTIVITIES .................. 59  
   8.2 RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO IMPROVING THE M&E PROCESS ............................................. 60  
9. REFERENCES .................................................................................................................................................... 61
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report concludes the three year M&E process of the TVSD Initiative. In many respects, this report and the TVSD Initiative's M&E process over the past three years, has essentially been a partnership between the M&E Consultant, the COL TVSD ES, COL's institutional and organisational partners, its consultants and the few teachers who have been interviewed and who shared their case studies.

Dr Alison Mead Richardson, the dynamic COL ES, has however been instrumental in guiding the work of this evaluation report and the M&E process over the past three years. She provided conceptual insight and clarity from both her own and COL's perspective and generously shared her observations and views based on her hands-on experience with COL partners across the four regions.

Some of the leaders of organisations and institutions have also been interviewed for the first time for this 2015 report. Dr Walter Vermeulen from METI, Edward Bethel from the College of the Bahamas and Shahnewaz Khan from DAM have offered inspiring insights and generously shared photos and stories of their experiences where possible. COL consultant Dr Gayathri Jayatilleke from the Open University Sri Lanka has also provided information about COL’s work in Sri Lanka.

The reports provided by various COL consultants have been an important source of information and offered another perspective of COL's work and local partnerships.

Finally Ms Charisse Cruz, Programme Assistant at COL, have been very supportive with providing reports and information required to complete this report.
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>Overview of COL TVSD Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2</td>
<td>TVSD Outcome Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Summary of TVSD M&amp;E Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>COL-Supported Activities 1 July 2014 to 30 June 2015 in Africa, Asia, Caribbean and Pacific Regions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>Overview of Course Participation and Subsequent Activities by Participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>Data on the number of learners that have studied FELS online courses. September 2014 – March 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>Data on the number of learners that have studied FELS online courses 2: September 2014 – March 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>TVSD Cumulative Results 2012-2013-2014: Summary of Outcomes Achieved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Outputs Achieved 1 July 2014 to 31 March 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CLCs</td>
<td>Community Learning Centres (DAM, Bangladesh)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COL</td>
<td>Commonwealth of Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCD</td>
<td>Certificate in Community Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVCE</td>
<td>Centre for Vocational and Continuing Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLN</td>
<td>Community Learning Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAM</td>
<td>Dhaka Ahsania Mission, Bangladesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFAT</td>
<td>Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ES</td>
<td>Education Specialist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FELS</td>
<td>Faculty of Education and Liberal Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FC</td>
<td>Future Co-ordinators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOL</td>
<td>Flexible and Open Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INVEST</td>
<td>Innovation in Vocational Education &amp; Skills Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LCC</td>
<td>Learning Centre Co-ordinators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METI</td>
<td>Matuaileoo Environmental Trust Inc., Samoa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLHRD</td>
<td>Ministry of Labour and Human Resource Development, Kiribati</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAITA</td>
<td>National Apprentice and Industrial Training Authority, Sri Lanka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODFL</td>
<td>Open Distance and Flexible Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OER</td>
<td>Open Education Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODL</td>
<td>Open and Distance Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGDE</td>
<td>Post Graduate Diploma in Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNG</td>
<td>Papua New Guinea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRCK</td>
<td>State Resource Centre Kerala, India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWOT</td>
<td>Strengths Weaknesses Opportunities and Threats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET FOL</td>
<td>TVET Flexible &amp; Open Learning Unit, PNG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVETSSP</td>
<td>Technical &amp; Vocational Education &amp; Training Sector Strengthening Programme, Kiribati</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVSD</td>
<td>Technical &amp; Vocational Skills Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVOTEC</td>
<td>University of Vocational Technology, Sri Lanka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USP</td>
<td>University of South Pacific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTech</td>
<td>University of Technology, Jamaica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VRDTCA</td>
<td>Vanuatu Rural Development &amp; Training Centres Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WITU</td>
<td>Women in Technology Uganda</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This document reports on progress made based on monitoring activities of the Commonwealth of Learning (COL)’s Technical Vocational and Skills Development (TVSD) Initiative between July 2014 and February 2015 and it provides a summative evaluation of the Initiative’s outcomes over the three years extending from 1 July 2012 to March 2015.

COL has strengthened its existing work in Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific with TVET Institutions, NGOs, CBOs and Universities over the past three years. This work served mainly to strengthen the institutional capability of COL’s partners through the appropriate use of ICT and improving their capacity to use new pedagogies through FaB learning approaches.

Over the three years, the TVSD Initiative’s intended outcomes were to deliver on the following by 2015:

**TVSD Outcome Indicators**

| TVSD OUTCOME STATEMENT: |
| "Organisations and institutions increase equitable access to quality TVSD through flexible and blended approaches, particularly for the informal sector" |

| Outcome Indicators |
| By February 2015, 20 institutions in 15 countries start or strengthen FaB learning and substantially increase their learner enrolments, particularly for the informal sector |
| 15 new quality OER TVSD courses are in use |
| New technology-enhanced quality TVSD course components are in use in 20 institutions |

| Qualitative |
| Formal TVET Institutions increase access to skills training programmes by |
| • developing strategic objectives for flexible learning; creating institutional ODFL policy; |
| • creating new organisational structures; |
| • building the capacity of teachers to use FaB approaches; and developing new courses for learners working in the informal sector to meet social responsibility requirements and contribute to a viable business model for flexible learning. |
| Organisations (non-formal) increase access to skills training programmes through flexible, resource-based learning |

COL has systematically integrated a coherent and evolving monitoring and evaluation framework and process in the design and implementation of its TVSD Initiative, including the INVEST Africa programme since its inception. Over the three years (1 July 2012 to 30 June 2015) this process has included the development of:

1. A Baseline Report in 2012;
2. a TVSD M&E Framework in 2012;
4. A revised and updated M&E Framework in March 2014;
5. Two annual TVSD M&E reports (including a separate, accompanying INVEST Africa M&E Report) that covered the period July 2012 to June 2013, July 2013 to June 2014; and
6. Two half-yearly monitoring reports which covered the six month period ending December 2012 and December 2013.

The research for this report relied heavily on data obtained through secondary sources of information. In the main, these include COL consultant reports, partner reports and materials; reports from the COL TVSD ES; and a few interviews with COL partners.

1.1. FINDINGS

1.1.1 Nine Months to March 2015
The M&E research found that COL delivered on 16 different activities which reached 106 participants in Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific during the nine months ending 31 March 2015.

1.1.2 Consolidated Findings 2012 to 2015
By March 2015, the TVSD Initiative has worked with 64 institutions in 22 countries in Africa, Asia the Caribbean and the Pacific over the three years: 2012 to 2015. The TVSD Initiative exceeded its outcome targets in terms of number of countries and institutions reached; that partners together reached 6,694 new learners in new non formal courses and 8,272 new learners in new flexible core programmes. TVSD Partners produced 158 new courses or courses that are in the process of being developed and 16 Open Education Resources. Furthermore, 45 institutions or organisations have new technology-enhanced course components in use.

1.2 ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS
COL's work in each of the four regions produced outcomes that reflect that nature, number and size of the institutions and organisations that COL partnered with, each with varying capacities to deliver on the support provided by COL.

Based on an analysis of outcomes achieved over the three year period 2012 to 2015, the evaluation found that the TVSD Initiative has been effective, efficient and relevant for its partners. It also found that the Initiative is designed for sustainability and has promoted gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls with some TVSD partners.

The report provides evidence of the TVSD Initiative's effectiveness in contributing towards COL's impact statement by strengthening the capability of institutions to reach substantial numbers of Commonwealth citizens, by supporting institutional policy and strategy development; by supporting the development and use of OER; by improving the capability of teachers to integrate FaB learning and teaching; and by promoting gender equality and women's empowerment.
The nature of policy changes in INVEST Africa institutions reflects a shift towards FaB learning and teaching and ODFL, as discussed in the INVEST Africa 2014 and 2015 M&E reports (Isaacs, 2015, Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2014).

In the regions outside of Africa, COL support for institutional FaB-related policies and strategies, have been more targeted and limited to fewer institutions and organisations where there was receptiveness to policy and strategy support. COL provided technical support in Kiribati and the HEART Trust/NTA COL is also specifically referenced in the draft Open and Distance Learning Policy of the College of the Bahamas and reviewed the draft ICT policy of St Vincent and the Grenadines Community College states that its main purpose is to ensure the effective protection and proper usage of their ICT system (SVGCC, 2015).

Policies related to ODFL and ICT seem still to be in draft form and it seems that the respective institutions require further support on related policies such as Acceptable and Fair Use policies and OER policies, as also suggested by Herd (2015). Similarly, with change in digital technologies being so rapid, new issues are also emerging that require policy direction. These include issues related to big data, MOOCs and learning analytics amongst others, and how these support and feed into emerging ODFL approaches. Here it is clear that policy and strategy development support is an important area for COL’s continued support and investment.

An analysis of the experience of teachers in INVEST over the past three years shows that teachers have been integrating digital technologies in their classroom practice and have been using flexible and blended learning approaches with their learners. This analysis also places many of the INVEST teachers in the Technological Literacy category of the UNESCO ICT Competency Framework although some may also be considered to be in the Knowledge Deepening category (Isaacs, 2015).

Based on three individual case studies (in Fiji, Jamaica and SVG) and some insights shared by Herd (2015) on the actual use of digital technologies in support of FaB learning and teaching in classroom practice, it seems that teachers in the Pacific and the Caribbean have begun the journey of adopting and integrating more recent Web 2.0 technologies in their practice, which also places them, as with INVEST teachers, both within and beyond the Technological Literacy category of the UNESCO ICT Competency Framework. In the case of METI, the Director indicated that at this stage, there was not much use of digital technologies in teaching and learning practice of their activities, however the Social Media training workshop of NGO representatives integrated these approaches within their workshop delivery practice. Similarly, the DAM training programmes also reportedly used digital technologies to a limited extent.

Another important TVSD outcome is the production of courseware as OER. The evaluation found that partners are also using OERs even if they are not yet producers of OER. An example would be Ginigoada Bisnis Foundation in PNG. They use COL OERs such as Learning About Small Business and adapt them for delivery in their non-formal skills training programmes. All eLearning training includes an introduction to OER and all teachers are encouraged to identify, evaluate and adapt existing OER materials for their own
teaching content. This is happening in the INVEST partner institutions, at SVGCC and in some HEART institutions.

That COL has exceeded its outcome in co-producing OER with its partners and that it also takes it a step further to encourage and support the use of the OER through training programmes and encouraging their upload onto Moodle at institutional level to make them more accessible, reflects a commitment by COL to ensure that the materials add value to learning and teaching among its institutional partners.

**The report also provides evidence of the TVSD Initiative's cost effectiveness.** COL’s TVSD Initiative spent CAD$1,258,279 on TVSD activities in all four regions from 1 July 2012 to 30 March 2015 which translates crudely into **an estimated CAD$19,661 on average, per institution over three years.** This average figure cannot be applied across the board to all institutions because COL not only invested more in some institutions relative to others over the three years but also only partnered with some institutions very recently relative to others who have been COL partners for a period beyond the three years covering this evaluation.

Could more and better outcomes have been achieved per institution if each was given CAD$19,661 directly to invest in FAB and OFL capacity building activities? It is assumed that the wide range of expertise and networks that COL provides in its institutional capacity building programmes and activities provide a more cost effective and cost efficient way of promoting greater and more equitable access to quality skills development for citizens of the Commonwealth.

**The report also found that the relevance of the TVSD Initiative to the partner institutions and organisations across all four regions is reflected by the initiative taken and leadership shown by COL’s partners to adopt ODFL in TVSD at various levels.** A number of COL partners initiated policy and strategy development and sought COL support in their own locally-driven plans.

**The report also found that COL focuses on building partnerships that can sustain the support that COL provides.** has tended to work mainly with partners who have demonstrated capability to own, support and manage the activities by themselves. COL’s role has consistently been to provide thought leadership, technical expertise, and limited resources to support course development, capacity building, and policy and strategy development in the main. The onus has been on partner institutions and organisations to take responsibility for follow up activities related to cascading training, further implementation and maintenance.

**The report also provides evidence of a few areas where the promotion of gender equality by COL surfaced prominently in all four regions,** from support amongst others, for the formation of WITED Chapters in African institutions to a course to promote financial literacy and business development in Uganda to livelihood skills for girls in Vanuatu. This remains a very important area for continued COL support and engagement. Here the plans to produce a gender equality toolkit for INVEST could also be extended to other regions and the more conscious programme activities, monitoring, evaluation and research on the gendered experience with ODFL will make an important contribution to shifting issues of gender from the margins to the centre of the changes in TVSD.
1.3 LESSONS
The key lessons across the four regions include:

- The importance of partnering with the ‘right’ institution at local level. Here ‘right’ refers to institutions who are ready to commit to, act on and sustain the changes that accompany the shift to ODFL and the integration of digital technologies.
- Timing matters in partnership development. COL’s experience so far has also shown that institutions who were not ready two years ago may be more ready a year or two later. The Heart/NTA Trust is a good example of this.
- COL needs to work more strategically with institutions that are more ready to support a scaled-up approach of national strategic value. Here the choice of expending more energy and budget on the promotion of country-wide programs such as in Kenya and possibly Jamaica, becomes an important consideration.
- COL needs to consider carefully, the institutions it can no longer continue to support because not much progress has been made over the past three years.

1.4. CONCLUSION
The strengths of the Initiative include:

- The hands-on role played by the COL ES and the thought leadership role that she provides.
- COL has also been able to hire local consultants in some cases, to support its work in some areas. This contributes to keeping costs lower through avoiding flight costs and has proven to be very significant for local institutions and communities.
- The TVSD Initiative has also made attempts to leverage internal partnerships with the cross-cutting eLearning Initiative at COL.
- COL’s focus on experiences in the informal sector and promoting gender equality and women’s empowerment are defining features, certainly of its INVEST programme and in Bangladesh.

Whilst the programme clearly has many strengths, it is still confronted with the following inter-related challenges:

- Less knowledge sharing and collaboration across the four regions is a weakness of the Initiative.
- The sterling work done by COL in TVSD does not appear to be very widely known and has the potential for further awareness raising among other actors and stakeholders in the global TVET system and in this way, the prospects for further partnership and resource mobilization could open up.
- With a limited budget and limited human resource capacity at COL for the TVSD Initiative less time and money is available to leverage further resources and partnerships which can expand the work of COL.
• The Initiative relies on the provision of technical support via external consultants. With additional budget that can be used to leverage additional resources, the Initiative could spend more on supporting programmatic implementation.

1.5 RECOMMENDATIONS

The report provides the following recommendations related to the Initiative's inputs and activities

• That COL maintains this advantage by continuing to support strategic institutions and countries on policy and strategy development because these create an enabling environment for the implementation of ODFL and guides the practice of ODFL in TVSD.
• That COL encourages further collaboration and knowledge sharing in the policy and strategy development space across the four regions. Here the example of HEART/NTA Trust’s involvement in the CLN and drawing on the experience of INVEST Africa is worth highlighting.
• That COL takes on more of a leadership role in this respect by catalysing deeper conversation and debate on the conceptual underpinnings of the FaB learning model and ODFL in TVET and how these enable the expansion in access to quality TVSD for all.
• That COL considers raising the profile of its work on TVSD at strategic global forums. Not only does this create awareness of COL’s experience but it also allows COL to leverage partnerships and resources to expand its work.
• That COL fosters stronger collaboration and synergies among its more strategic institutions in Kenya and Jamaica especially from the perspective of scaling up FaB approaches to TVSD at national level.

It also makes recommendations on improving the M&E process. These include:

• That more Skype interviews be planned and conducted with consultants, institutional heads and where possible, with teachers and organisational or institutional staff as well.
• That further case studies be considered for a sample of teachers across all four regions and that tracer studies be conducted with learners, trainees and workshop participants as far as possible across the four regions.
• Tracking the number of OER downloads from the websites of COL and its partners will give further indication of the impact that this area of work is likely to have.
• Attendance by the M&E Consultant at the Partners Meeting of the INVEST Africa Principals and Policymakers has proven to be invaluable. It is recommended that the M&E Consultant attend meetings where representatives from other regions also gather. Here COL’s Pan Commonwealth Forum may be best suited for face to face engagement with partners from other regions.
2. INTRODUCTION

This document is both a monitoring report and a summative evaluation report. It reports on progress made based on monitoring activities of the Commonwealth of Learning (COL), Technical Vocational and Skills Development (TVSD) Initiative between July 2014 and February 2015 and it provides a summative evaluation of the Initiative's outcomes over the three years extending from 1 July 2012 to March 2015.

The report also focuses on specific regions in which COL has focused its partnerships and activities. They include Asia (Bangladesh, India and Sri Lanka), the Caribbean (The Bahamas, Jamaica and St Vincent and the Grenadines) and the Pacific (Fiji, Kiribati, Papua New Guinea, Samoa and Vanuatu).

The evaluation of TVSD activities with the Innovation in Vocational Education and Skills Training (INVEST Africa) programme is available as a separate report although its findings are included in this report as part of aggregating the experience with the overall TVSD Initiative. This report also includes COL activities in partnership with Women In Technology in Uganda (WITU).

3. CONTEXT AND BACKGROUND

COL believes that through flexible and blended (FAB), open and distances learning (ODL) enabled by the appropriate integration of digital technologies, equitable access to quality skills development can be expanded to reach larger numbers of Commonwealth citizens. The TVSD Theory of Change proposes “that substantial and sustainable opportunities for technical and vocational skills development can be provided through support to NGOs to develop more scalable models and a change in focus of formal TVET institutions to expand access and improve quality through flexible and blended approaches.”

In Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific, the TVSD Initiative works with Technical & Vocational Training Institutions, NGOs, CBOs and Universities to strengthen their institutional capability through the appropriate use of ICT and improving their capacity to use new pedagogies through FaB learning approaches. The aim is to increase access to good quality skills training especially for women and people working in the informal sector.

Figure 1 below provides an overview of the countries and the institutions that COL has worked with between 1 July 2012 and 31 March 2015. It shows that COL works with 15 institutions in 11 countries across the 3 regions. These institutions include NGOs, TVET institutions, TVET units in relevant tertiary institutions, TVET units in relevant Government ministries and departments responsible for TVET; as well as national training authorities. It shows further that COL’s capacity building activities include the development of relevant courses, training materials and related training workshops as well providing technical support for TVET policy and strategy development. Much of the focus of these activities involve introducing flexible, blended and open approaches to skills development and the promotion of sustainable livelihoods.
**Figure 1: Overview of COL TVSD Partnerships**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Name of Institution</th>
<th>Type of Institution</th>
<th>COL’s TVSD Focus 2012-2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFRICA</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Women in Technology Uganda</td>
<td>A non-profit organisation aimed at encouraging, inspiring and training women in the technology sector through networking, training and mentoring.</td>
<td>COL supported a <strong>three month training course</strong> delivered by WITU, mainly attended by women to gain financial literacy and business skills and to start their own businesses. This three month course proved to be successful and empowering for women in business.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)</td>
<td>An NGO established in 1985 focused on the spiritual and social development of the community (DAM, 2015). They offer programmes in a wide range of sectors including technical and vocational skills development based on 13 different courses in engineering, construction, the informal economy and ready-made garment-making. They deliver these courses through six TVET institutions. <a href="http://www.ahsaniamission.org.bd/">http://www.ahsaniamission.org.bd/</a></td>
<td>Development of <strong>training materials</strong> to support livelihood skills development. Training of district literacy officers in development of participatory community level learning materials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIA</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>State Resource Centre Kerala (SRCK)</td>
<td>An independent, autonomous entity funded by the Government Department of Elementary Education and Literacy in India. It was established in 1978 and provides academic and technical support to Adult and Continuing Education agencies in Kerala, India. <a href="http://src.kerala.gov.in/">http://src.kerala.gov.in/</a></td>
<td>Development of Certificate in Community Development by <strong>distance learning</strong> (CCD). Facilitated <strong>workshops</strong> to plan the programme, develop and improve the <strong>quality</strong> of the course materials. Capacity building <strong>workshops</strong> for writers, programme staff, Learning Centre Co-ordinators (LCCs) and Future Counsellors (FCs) to deliver the CCD extensively and optimally. <strong>Training of experts</strong> as prospective tutors, assessors, field visit guides, and programme evaluators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>National Apprentice and Industrial Authority (NAITA)</td>
<td>Training authority in Sri Lanka set up to co-ordinate and regulate enterprise based apprenticeships. Also provides vocational and Technical Training for youth, focused on growing employable skills based on professional standards and labour market needs of industry. <a href="http://www.naita.gov.lk/">http://www.naita.gov.lk/</a></td>
<td>COL supported a <strong>quality review</strong> of NAITA’s Enterprise Based Apprenticeship (EBA) ODL Training Programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>University of Vocational Technology (UNIVOTEC)</td>
<td>Established in 2008, UNIVOTEC provides technical and vocational education to assist students in the TVET sector to obtain a university education. They also provide pedagogical training for Trainers serving in TVET organizations; they develop course curricula for TVET sector; and provide extension courses on continuous professional development. <a href="http://www.univotec.ac.lk/">http://www.univotec.ac.lk/</a></td>
<td>Training on the <strong>design of online National Diploma in Technical Teacher Education</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Name of Institution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahamas</td>
<td>College of the Bahamas in transition to becoming The University of The Bahamas</td>
<td>A comprehensive public college, founded in 1974, transitioning to a university that grants graduate and undergraduate degrees as well as post graduate diplomas. In 2013 it had 4757 students (part time and full time) of which 73% were women. <a href="http://www.cob.edu.bs/">http://www.cob.edu.bs/</a></td>
<td>COL provided input on their Distance Education Policy and Strategy documents.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>The Human Employment and Resources Training (HEART) Trust, National Training Agency (NTA)</td>
<td>The HEART Trust NTA is a training organisation established in 1982 in Jamaica. It operates a network of 29 TVET institutions offering Level 1 to Level 3 programmes to provide job-ready training for entry level workers. <a href="http://www.heart-nta.org/">http://www.heart-nta.org/</a></td>
<td>Capacity building for online materials development to strengthen their online learning programme; training in online materials development and training in instructional design of HEART Trust NTA staff; Training in flexible TVET systems and quality assurance for HEART Managers.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Faculty of Education &amp; Liberal Studies (FELS) at University of Technology (UTech)</td>
<td>A faculty based at the University of Technology that has a School of Technical and Vocational Education focused on education for secondary and post secondary technical teachers. <a href="https://www.utech.edu.jm/colleges_faculties/FELS/sotave/index.html">https://www.utech.edu.jm/colleges_faculties/FELS/sotave/index.html</a></td>
<td>Support for online course development and capacity building of staff in blended online teaching and learning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Vincent &amp; the Grenadines (SVG)</td>
<td>SVG Community College</td>
<td>SVGCC is an amalgamation of 4 divisions into one college in 2005. It has more than 2000 students. It has a Division of Technical &amp; Vocational Education <a href="http://www.svgcc.vc/">http://www.svgcc.vc/</a></td>
<td>Capacity building workshops for staff on eLearning and Moodle. Staff and management training on flexible and blended learning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CANTA</td>
<td>Caribbean Association of National Training Agencies</td>
<td>An association of Caribbean national training agencies. <a href="http://cantaonline.org/">http://cantaonline.org/</a></td>
<td>Workshop for institutional and NTA representatives from 10 Caribbean countries to introduce the COL TVSD flexible and blended model and discuss regional collaboration.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiji</td>
<td>PACIFIC TAFE at University of South Pacific</td>
<td>Centre based at the University of South Pacific and part of the Pacific Technical And Further Education (Pacific TAFE) which provides vocational &amp; professional programmes and short courses for post-secondary and mature students. <a href="http://www.usp.ac.fj/index.php?id=8346">http://www.usp.ac.fj/index.php?id=8346</a></td>
<td>Capacity building for design and development of flexible learning materials for Community Development training; courses made available as OER. Quality assurance for course development on teacher training; 4 courses to be made available as OER. Participation in the 2 regional workshops in Flexible TVET.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kiribati</td>
<td>Ministry of Labour &amp; Human Resource Development</td>
<td>The ministry manages the 3 major technical institutions: Marine Training Centre (MTC), Kiribati Institute of Technology (KIT) and Fisheries Training Centre (FTC), which provides skills training to youths in Kiribati.</td>
<td>Support for the development of a TVET outer island delivery strategy in Kiribati. Participation in the 2 regional workshops in Flexible TVET.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Name of Institution</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Papua New Guinea</td>
<td>Flexible and Open Learning Unit</td>
<td>Newly created branch in the PNG government Department of TVET Wing of Department of Education responsible for promoting flexible, blended and open learning approaches.</td>
<td>Building capacity to establish flexible programme offerings to increase access to skills training in the Port Moresby area. 7 institutions developing pilot courses. 2 capacity building workshops, for writers and remote support for materials development; Capacity building for TVET Wing Managers in planning and administration of flexible TVET. Participation in the 2 regional workshops in Flexible TVET.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samoa</td>
<td>Matuaileoo Environment Trust Inc. (METI)</td>
<td>A charitable trust set up to provide a service to the people of Samoa that promotes the preservation of their Environment, and the sustainable development of their natural resources. Has a staff of 8 and has 8 core trainers. <a href="https://metisamoa.wordpress.com/">https://metisamoa.wordpress.com/</a></td>
<td>Capacity building for Life Skills Coach Training and to develop a Life Skills Coach Trainers Manual. Training programme for life skills coaches (who are known as Taiala); Capacity building in instructional design - Permaculture and Healthy Living training Manual development. Training in use of social media for community development.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samoa National Youth Council</td>
<td>A Youth Council, part of Division of Youth in the Ministry of Women Community and Social Development. It promotes responsible youth citizenship through youth development projects and programs. <a href="http://pacificyouthcouncil.com/?page_id=1630">http://pacificyouthcouncil.com/?page_id=1630</a></td>
<td>Representatives participated in COL-supported workshop on Social Media for NGOs in Samoa.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.1 TVSD OUTCOME INDICATORS

Figure 2 provides an overview of the overall TVSD outcome indicators for the current triennium which extends from 1 July 2012 to 30 June 2015.

Figure 2: TVSD Outcome Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TVSD OUTCOME STATEMENT:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Organisations and institutions increase equitable access to quality TVSD through flexible and blended approaches, particularly for the informal sector”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quantitative</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By February 2015, 20 institutions in 15 countries start or strengthen FaB learning and substantially increase their learner enrolments, particularly for the informal sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 new quality OER TVSD courses are in use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New technology-enhanced quality TVSD course components are in use in 20 institutions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Qualitative** |
| Formal TVET Institutions increase access to skills training programmes by |
| • developing strategic objectives for flexible learning; creating institutional ODFL policy; |
| • creating new organisational structures; |
| • building the capacity of teachers to use FaB approaches; and developing new courses for learners working in the informal sector to meet social responsibility requirements and contribute to a viable business model for flexible learning. |
| Organisations (non-formal) increase access to skills training programmes through flexible, resource-based learning |

Figure 2 shows that the Initiative’s intended outcome is to improve the institutional capability of a specific number of local institutions to introduce FAB ODL and expand their number of learners, especially for women in the informal sector. The success of the Initiative is based on whether it can show that it has supported the development of FAB ODL policies and strategies; the development of open courseware including technology-enhanced course components; reached learners in the informal sector through these courses and programmes and promoted gender equality.
4. EVALUATION FRAMEWORK AND METHODOLOGY

As explained in the TVSD M&E Framework (Isaacs and Mead-Richardson 2012 and 2013), the approach to M&E for the Initiative is guided by COL’s adoption of the Theory of Change and Results-based approach to monitoring and evaluation. COL has systematically integrated a coherent and evolving monitoring and evaluation framework and process in the design and implementation of its TVSD Initiative, including the INVEST Africa programme since its inception.

Over the three years (1 July 2012 to 30 June 2015) this process has included the development of:

8. A Baseline Report for INVEST Africa in 2012;
9. a TVSD M&E Framework in 2012;
10. A Quality Assurance Framework for INVEST Africa in December 2012;
11. A revised and updated TVSD M&E Framework in March 2014;
12. Two annual TVSD M&E reports that covered the period July 2012 to June 2013, July 2013 to June 2014; and
13. Two half-yearly monitoring reports which covered the six month period ending December 2012 and December 2013.

This document represents another milestone in the implementation of the TVSD Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. It reflects on the experience, insights and lessons of the key stakeholders in the TVSD Initiative during the final year of the current triennium and it consolidates the experience over the three years from July 2012 to June 2015 in the form of a summative evaluation. A summary of the deliverables in the M&E process is shown in Figure 3.

Figure 3: Summary of TVSD M&E Process
This document represents another milestone in the implementation of the TVSD Monitoring and Evaluation Framework over the three years of the current triennium.

4.1 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

As explained in the Revised M&E Framework for the TVSD Initiative, both qualitative and quantitative research methods are applied, as well as inclusive and participatory approaches, within the limits of the Initiative's budget. The evaluation questions and related data gathering methods are mapped against the OECD Development Assistance Committee’s international criteria of Relevance; Effectiveness; Efficiency; Impact; and Sustainability.

The research for this report relied heavily on data obtained through secondary sources of information. In the main, these include COL consultant reports, partner reports and materials; reports from the COL TVSD ES; and a few interviews with COL partners.

4.1.1 Consultant Reports

The reports provided by COL consultants on their various activities in the three TVSD regions, are a central source of information. These were mainly reports on capacity building workshops and expertise provided to TVSD institutions, government ministries, NGOs and CBOs. These reports were critically examined and included in summaries of inputs provided by COL. Some of them included appendices which verified the outputs that emerged from the various capacity building activities. These mostly served as the only form of evidence to validate the work carried out by the COL consultants.

4.1.2 Skype Calls with COL Consultants and Partners

Skype calls were conducted with one COL consultant working in the Pacific and COL Partner representatives in Asia, the Pacific and the Caribbean. These calls assumed the form of informal, unstructured interviews which focused mainly on their experience with TVSD partnership activities in their respective institutions and the nature of the support provided by COL.

4.1.3 COL ES Reports and Skype Calls

The TVSD ES provided the M&E Consultant with copies of her reports on visits to various institutions and organisations in Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific. These often provided information on meetings held with partners, prospective partners and consultants.

One Skype call was conducted with the COL ES with particular reference to the overall TVSD M&E process. This call served mainly to provide clarity on TVSD activities and the ES’ views and insights on the way forward for COL with reference to their partnership with institutions in the three regions.

4.2 LIMITATIONS

The research process encountered three key inter-related limitations.

1. One of the most critical limitations relates to the budgetary constraints of the TVSD programme which did not make it possible for the M&E Consultant to verify the data provided by COL partners, consultants and the COL TVSD ES through site visits, face to face interviews or
observations at workshops and events. The M&E Consultant relied heavily therefore, on secondary sources of information in the form of workshop and consultancy reports by consultants and event reports by the COL ES. These tend to provide mainly a subjective account of the activities, even though in some cases, evidence was provided in the form of photographs, action plans, lists of courses and course materials.

2. The COL ES reports served to verify information obtained from the consultant reports to some extent. These reports were very useful and informative although also very brief and framed within COL requirements on travel reports.

3. Unlike with the INVEST partners, with whom the M&E Consultant has direct access via emails, at face to face partner meetings or via the Community Learning Network where their voices and views are reflected, in the case of the TVSD partners in Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific, she has had very limited contact with and access to the leadership and champions of TVSD partner institutions. Another example of the difference between INVEST and the broader TVSD Initiative’s M&E process is that Principals of INVEST institutions also provide institutional reports which reflect their views and experiences directly, whereas this is not the case with the broader TVSD Initiative where partner institutions range from NGOs and CBOs to TVET institutions. For this reason, the data used for the M&E process predominantly reflects the views and insights of stakeholders who are external to the day to day institutional experience and practice of the TVSD Initiative.

These limitations were overcome to some extent in the following ways:

1. More consultants and partners were available for Skype interviews for this evaluation, compared to evaluations conducted over the previous two years. In these interviews, partners were able to refer to additional materials and documents which could verify the activities that have taken place and the outputs and outcomes achieved. These additional documents included stories of success cases as well as pictures of participants at work, applying the skills that they have learned.

2. In some cases, the M&E consultant would check up on information through Google searches and visits to partner organisation websites where these are available.

3. In the cases of courses that were developed, proof of this was provided. The M&E Consultant had access to the courseware supported by COL and could also verify their status as OERs.

4. The M&E Consultant was provided with a list of institutional heads, champions and consultant for all COL partners in all three regions. This allowed the Consultant to make contact and arrange for Skype interviews. Five respondents sent positive responses.

4.3 Costs of Monitoring and Evaluation
There are a range of costs associated with monitoring and evaluating the TVSD Initiative which are shared between partners, COL overhead costs and direct costs of hiring evaluation consultants. Partners
provide institutional reports and in some cases carry out their own course evaluations and provide reports to COL. Individual teachers contribute their time to produce case studies of their learning journey with the flexible and blended model. The COL ES and Programme Assistant spend substantive time monitoring outputs and outcomes and collating data reports. The ES has made specific visits to 5 INVEST institutions to facilitate training in M&E for partners.

The direct costs of evaluating the TVSD initiative total CAD 51,134 over the three year period which represents 4% of the total initiative expenditure. This figure is included in the total spend on TVSD noted in Section 6.2 on efficiency.
5. FINDINGS

The findings below document the inputs and outputs that were delivered during the period under review.

5.1 NINE MONTHS TO MARCH 2015

The list of FSD inputs that were delivered during 1 July 2014 and 31 March 2015 shown in Figure 3 below.

During the period under review, COL engaged in the following activities to support the development of ODFL capacity in the institutions in Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific. These activities were delivered based on the planned activities for this period and other requests arising from new partners.

The focus of COL activities has been on conducting capacity building workshops and providing consultancy support services in strategic areas to promote flexible skills development in specific institutions and organisations. Figure 4 summarises the inputs between 1 July 2014 and 30 June 2015.

Figure 4: COL-Supported Activities 1 July 2014 to 31 March 2015 in Africa, Asia, Caribbean and Pacific Regions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Activity type</th>
<th>Means of Verification</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>September 2014</td>
<td>Revision of and audio materials integration into the Literacy &amp; Numeracy in Basic Trades course for FOL unit in the TVET Wing of the Department of Education, PNG</td>
<td>National University of Samoa</td>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>Course Development</td>
<td>Updated course materials</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 22 – October 3, 2014</td>
<td>Capacity building in flexible TVET systems and learning materials</td>
<td>Papua New Guinea</td>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>2 capacity building workshops, remote support for materials development</td>
<td>Consultancy report from Clint Smith</td>
<td>15 trained in Flexible TVET systems; 18 trained in materials development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September – October 2014</td>
<td>AMR visit to the Pacific</td>
<td>Tuvalu, Samoa, Solomon Islands, Fiji</td>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>Capacity Building</td>
<td>AMR Event Report</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 15, 2014</td>
<td>AMR facilitated a session for TVSD stakeholders in Tuvalu from a</td>
<td>Tuvalu</td>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>Capacity Building</td>
<td>AMR Event Report</td>
<td>25 TVSD diverse stakeholders from Tuvalu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Activity type</td>
<td>Means of Verification</td>
<td>Participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2, 2014</td>
<td>AMR facilitated a planning workshop for the DE Diploma in Construction</td>
<td>Solomon Islands</td>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>Capacity Building</td>
<td>AMR Event Report</td>
<td>3 SINU staff reached</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Management Team at the Solomon Islands National University.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strengthen the capacity of HEART Trust NTA to develop their ODFL Policy</td>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Caribbean</td>
<td>Remote engagement and</td>
<td>Consultancy Report from Ed du Vivier</td>
<td>6 HEART TRUST NTA staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Revision and adaptation of online Flexible Skills Development course</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>Pan</td>
<td>Capacity Building</td>
<td>Updated FSD Online Course and Caribbean version</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>for the Caribbean</td>
<td></td>
<td>Common-wealth</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September – October,</td>
<td>Instructional Design and Language Editing of SRC Kerala’s CCD Modules</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>Course Development</td>
<td>8 Completed Modules</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>Social Media Workshop for Samoa NGOS: METI, NUS, Samoa National Youth</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Council and Teachers Association</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 27-30, 2014</td>
<td>Instructional Design Workshop for METI and remote support for materials</td>
<td>Samoa</td>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>Capacity Building</td>
<td>Consultancy Report from Verleshwar Singh</td>
<td>10 Participants Trained from three organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Activity type</td>
<td>Means of Verification</td>
<td>Participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2014 – February 2015</td>
<td>Review of Cert IV 4 Courses - TAE</td>
<td>Fiji</td>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>Course Development</td>
<td>4 Completed Courses and Report from Michael Coghlan Three Completed Courses and Report from DAM Consultancy report from Shironica Consultancy report from Brian Sayer</td>
<td>12 lecturers trained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2014 – June 2015</td>
<td>Development of three Basic Trades Course</td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>Course Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 9-13, 2015</td>
<td>UNIVOTEC eLearning</td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>Course Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 17 -20, 2015</td>
<td>Assist HEART in developing Community Technical Institutions (CTI) in Jamaica Flexible TVET Workshop</td>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Caribbean</td>
<td>Consultancy Report and Consultancy report from George Herd</td>
<td>21 participants from 10 Caribbean countries and 2 regional associations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 11 – 13, 2015</td>
<td>Evaluation of eLearning at SVGCC and capacity building on institutional policy development for ICT and flexible learning</td>
<td>St Vincent and the Grenadines</td>
<td>Caribbean</td>
<td>Consultancy Report from George Herd</td>
<td>7 eCollege team members</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4 reflects 16 different activities which reached 106 participants during the period under review. Figure 4 also shows that COL has worked both at Pan-Commonwealth level, at regional, country and institutional levels.
5.1.1 PAN COMMONWEALTH CAPACITY BUILDING

FSD online is the TVSD basic online capacity building course for flexible TVET. It has been used extensively in the INVEST Africa programme which delivered 11 cohorts of participants over the three years. The Pacific Centre for Flexible & Open Learning for Development (PACFOLD) is now adapting this course for use among TVET institutions in the Pacific.

5.1.2 CAPACITY BUILDING IN ASIA

Over the past three years, COL focused its support on three key institutions in three Asian countries: the Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) in Bangladesh; the State Resource Centre in Kerala (SRCK) in India and UNIVOTEC in Sri Lanka.

5.1.2.1 BANGLADESH: Supporting Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)

Over the past three years (2012 to 2015) COL worked with DAM on the development of course materials on livelihood skills and capacity building workshops focused on using these materials. Since October 2014, COL also supported the development of three Basic Trades courses.

During 2012-2013, COL supported DAM with the development of five booklets and five animation videos on livelihood skills i.e. Batik Print, Nursery, Flower Gardening, Poultry Rearing and Vermi Compost. After a ceremony to launch these materials in February 2013, DAM used the materials in its different field based programmes to provide livelihood skills for participants in rural and urban communities. Mr Shahnewaz Khan said in an interview that these materials were available in Bengali and COL supported their translation into English. They are now available on the DAM website as well as the COL website.

During 2013-2014, COL supported a non-formal livelihood skills training programme based on the learning materials. The training was carried out in DAM’s rural Community Learning Centres (CLCs). DAM was contracted to carry out regular monitoring and reporting. By June 2014, using these materials, they trained 1593 neo-literate participants, among whom 1231 were women and 362 were men. After receiving training, 478 beneficiaries reportedly started businesses among whom 364 were women and 114 were men.

By June 2014, COL also partnered with DAM and UNESCO Bangladesh in two training workshops organised with CLC facilitators and Union Information Service Centre (UISC) entrepreneurs on how to develop and use local materials. Twenty participants were involved in the workshop in the Sylhet district and another twenty in the Rangpur district.

By the end of the workshops, participants had reportedly learned about:

- Creativity in material development;
- Material presentation style;
- Innovative ways of using the materials;
- Different format of material;
- Local resources for material development;
- Development of material using information from different sources;
- Importance of material in effective learning;
- Needs assessment; and
- Peer assessment.

Participants at the local level materials development workshop in Sylhet District, Bangladesh
Figure 5: Overview of Course Participation and Subsequent Activities by Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Vermy Compost</th>
<th>Nursery</th>
<th>Batik Print</th>
<th>Poultry Rearing</th>
<th>Flower Cultivation</th>
<th>Grand Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Persons attended the training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>598</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>1191</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>2419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>314</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>829</td>
<td>365</td>
<td>1505</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>3194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons who took initiative to start small business</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>862</td>
<td>1140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>597</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>784</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>1514</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>1258</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons who started business</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>572</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>738</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>545</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>1300</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons started production</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>572</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>738</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>545</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>1300</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons started selling their production in the market</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>572</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>738</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>545</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>1300</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1061</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 5: Pictures of Course Participants Who Started their own Businesses

Anju Sankar working in her flower garden

Habib Rahman preparing vermy compost

Rawshan Ara selling eggs produced on her farm

Rehana Khatun working on her poultry farm

Photos courtesy of Shahnewaz Khan, Chief Executive Officer (CEO)
Center for International Education and Development (CINED)
DAM also distributed 335 sets of these materials to individuals who were mainly unemployed youth, women and retired and senior citizens.

In October 2014, COL partnered with DAM in the development of three Basic Trades courses which are due to be completed by June 2015. They are developing Beauty Care, Sewing Machine Operation and Karchupi (hand embroidery) all at Prevocational level II.

COL’s partnership with DAM has enabled the institution to be impactful with its target communities. According to Mr Khan, the value of these courses and training programmes lie in the fact that they are practical, hands-on and importantly, they are accessible to communities in rural areas who do not have access to the formal TVET system. Here the success lay in the fact that participants started businesses; that they were led by women and that they have had a direct positive influence on the livelihoods of participants.

Shahnewaz expressed keen interest to scale up access to the courses they offer. They engaged with various stakeholders to do so:

"We also send these materials to different offices. We have been talking to the Technical Education Board about scaling up access to the course and the use of the material and to introduce the new methodology of training which allows us to reach larger numbers."

However much of their work had come to a standstill at the time of the interview, due to political unrest in Bangladesh at the time. This situation, according to Shahnewaz, is destabilizing and disruptive and hampers progress especially since they were planning to complete their work within a few months.

This reflects the vulnerability of the programmes to the broader political and economic systems in the country.
5.1.2.2 INDIA: Workshops with the State Resource Centre Kerala (SRCK)

The SRCK is an independent Government funded organisation founded in 1978 to provide academic and technical support to adult education agencies in Kerala India. They support community learning centres around the state and the Preraks or volunteer community development workers. COL's TVSD Initiative has been working with SRCK since 2011. The nature of their partnership is based on growing SRCK's capacity to deliver distance learning programmes for Prerak training. COL supported the development of distance learning course materials for 4 courses that form part of a Certificate in Community Development (CCD). COL facilitated workshops to improve the quality of the course materials.

COL also provided technical support in the form of a consultant who provided remote support on the unit outlines and draft materials for the courses. The SRCK leadership was also negotiating accreditation for the course by the University of Kerala.

In 2013-2014 COL supported capacity building of Learning Centre Co-ordinators (LCCs) and Future Counsellors (FCs) to establish systems of program delivery and learning support so that this CCD could also be delivered extensively and optimally. Two inter-related workshops were successfully organised with LCCs and FCs accordingly (Panda, 2013).

During September and October 2014, COL supported further Instructional Design and language editing of the English language CCD courses. At the time of writing, the materials for the 4 courses in the Malayalam language were completed.

5.1.2.3 SRI LANKA: UNIVOTEC & NAITA

COL worked with two institutions in Sri Lanka: the University of Vocational Technology (UNIVOTEC) and the National Apprentice and Industrial Authority (NAITA). UNIVOTEC was established in 2008, and provides a university education for TVET students; training for TVET organisations and develop courses for the TVET sector. COL supported capacity building and the development of a National Diploma in TVET Teacher Training at UNIVOTEC in 2013-2015 which included the provision of technical expertise to support the design, development, review and quality assurance of the online teacher training course and the facilitation of workshops with UNIVOTEC staff.

By June 2014, UNIVOTEC reported that of the 6 modules, 2 had been completed and 4 were partially complete. By February 2015, all 6 modules had been completed. COL hired a consultant to support the completion of the course development and to review the materials. The work involved reviewing the current draft courses, assessing training needs, conducting a workshop in Moodle course development and providing remote support to the course development team to review and quality assure the course components.

The seven modules are the following:
1. Educational Psychology
2. Communication Skills for Teachers/Trainers
3. Training Programme Design (Basic)
4. Instructional Resources Development
5. Assessment of Learning
6. Teaching Learning Methods

7. Teaching Learning Methods

According to the consultant, by the time of the review in January 2015, five courses had been developed of which two were incomplete. It found that Module 2 had created a learner-centred environment because it included interactive online learning activities and provided course content compared to Module 1 was based on static content delivery via PowerPoint and Word documents.

The review also provided feedback on adapting the course for online delivery such inter alia, as adopting a knowledge construction approach; creating an active learning experience for learners; creating a challenging learning environment (Karunanayaka, 2015).

NAITA is the training authority in Sri Lanka set up to co-ordinate and regulate enterprise based apprenticeships. NAITA also provides vocational and technical training for youth and develops professional standards based on the labour market needs of industry. They offer 150 craft training courses under 22 vocational fields.

COL supported a quality review of the Enterprise Based Apprenticeship (EBA), ODL training programme of NAITA. COL ES visited NAITA in 2013 and agreed to assist with the improvement of the print-based distance learning materials which form the basis of theoretical learning for this training. The review was carried out by an ODL specialist from Open University of Sri Lanka, Dr Gayathri Jayatilleke using a template developed by COL TVSD based on international Distance Education Quality Assurance Criteria in 12 areas. The review found that there were serious constraints on the quality of this programme and provided a host of recommendations on how the programme could be improved. These recommendations included considerations related to the structure of NAITA’s Distance Education Unit and its role in supporting programmes like the EBA (Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2014c).

Since the review, the lack of human resource allocation to the NAITA DE Unit has been the subject of discussion at high levels of the Tertiary and Vocational Education Commission (national TVET apex agency) and it was agreed that COL’s recommendations should be followed and additional staff hired for the DE Unit. An interview with Dr Jayatilleke in March 2015, revealed that NAITA had taken COL’s advice, restructured the DE Unit and hired contract writers to develop course materials.

5.1.2 CAPACITY BUILDING IN THE PACIFIC

COL has a long history of supporting TVET in the Pacific at regional, country and institutional levels. At regional level, COL was instrumental in establishing Pacific TVET (PATVET) Forum which involved 26 participants from Ministries, NGOs, FBOs and TVET institutions in 8 Pacific countries. (COL, 2013b). Over the period 1 July 2012 to June 2015, COL worked with 9 Pacific island countries (Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2014c).

COL continued support for the introduction of flexible and open learning (FOL) in Papua New Guinea (PNG), Vanuatu and Kiribati. COL also works in Samoa, Nauru, Tuvalu, Fiji and the Solomon Islands.
5.1.2.1 PACIFIC REGION: Site Visits

The COL ES visited the Pacific four times during the current triennium – making a visit to all nine Commonwealth Pacific island nations. In Samoa in March 2013 she met with METI colleagues to review the Taiala training and facilitated a workshop at NUS on audio development; met with USP colleagues to progress the establishment of the PACFOLD regional centre and follow up on TVSD OER development and facilitated the Pacific TVET ODFL Forum in Tonga. In June 2013, she facilitated a consultation meeting on the Pacific regional centre in Vanuatu. In May -June 2014 she went to Fiji for the Regional Workshop on Flexible TVET, and visited partners in PNG, Kiribati, and Nauru and attended the Regional Centre consultation meeting. In September-October 2014 she visited Tuvalu, Samoa, Solomon Islands and Fiji. She facilitated several sessions at the 2014 Pacific Regional Focal Points meeting in Apia, Samoa from 22-24 September 2014. This meeting is organised every three years in each Commonwealth region and is led by the COL President & Vice President. It was hosted by the National University of Samoa and the Ministry of Education, Sports & Culture. The main purpose of this meeting was to determine priorities and needs for education and training in the Pacific and to identify COL’s role in addressing the needs in the region. The meeting concluded successfully with ideas and plans on COL’s partnership with the focal points in the region (Mead Richardson, 2014e).

5.1.2.2 PACIFIC REGION: Literacy & Numeracy in Basic Trades Course

At regional level, COL supported the revision of audio materials integration into the Literacy & Numeracy in Basic Trades course which is part of the Basic Trades Training for Small Island Nations, a programme of the PATVET-COL partnership. The development of the audio was carried out by the Communications Team at the National University of Samoa. They include a Student Workbook, Tutor Guide and Manager Guide which are produced as OERs, available under the Creative Commons Attribution Share-Alike License with Creative Commons. The audio materials were developed in the light of feedback from country partners who had piloted the print based materials when they requested audio support for learners and tutors. These materials are now available on the COL website.

5.1.2.3 PACIFIC REGION: Flexible TVET Workshop

In 2014-2015, the COL TVSD ES facilitated a workshop on Planning and Managing Flexible Learning with 26 TVET teachers from a range of partner institutions in 9 countries (Solomon Islands, PNG, Kiribati, Samoa, Nauru, Tuvalu, Fiji, Tonga, and Vanuatu). The workshop was hosted by the Centre for Vocational & Continuing Education (CVCE) at the University of the South Pacific (USP) in Fiji.

The participants were a mixed group of representatives from TVET institutions and NGOs and diverse and disparate experience with course design. All participants came with a course to develop or adapt for flexible delivery. By the end of the workshop, 17 new flexible courses had been planned. (Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2014c).

Also as a result of the Regional workshop on Flexible TVET, Ginigoada Bisnis Foundation in PNG has accessed COL OERs on small business management. They have adapted the materials and delivered small business training for a small group of 27 adult learners in Port Moresby. This is an adjunct to their literacy training.
5.1.2.4 SAMOA: Social Media Support for NGO Group

The Commonwealth of Learning (COL) has several NGO partners in Samoa all of whom are interested in harnessing social media to communicate with stakeholders to support and promote their objectives.

COL hired a consultant, Mr. Verleshwar Singh to develop and deliver a capacity building workshop on the use of social media for NGOs to increase the knowledge and usability of social media integration for effective capacity building. It was attended by 10 participants from three NGOs including METI, the Samoa National Youth Council, METI and the Samoa Teachers Association. By the end of the four-day workshop had worked on a toolkit on strategy, communications, social change, web presence, and social media for non-profit organisations (Singh, 2014).

5.1.2.5 SAMOA: Instructional Design Capacity Building for METI

METI works as a community development organisation through a small training team of eight qualified trainers who deliver training to the people in the villages. On this basis, they can reach only a few people. To scale up their training, METI needed a different approach.

METI developed a model in which select people from the rural villages were chosen for special training to enable them to deliver METI’s programmes to the villages. These select people were referred to as Taiala (Samoan for ‘path-breakers’) or community development workers in Samoan villages. Among the Taiala are retired public servants and ‘housewives’. They are currently paid for a period of one to two years by the government of Samoa.

The Taiala are the key target audience for capacity building in instructional design because through them, METI is able to expand access to skills development to larger numbers of people in Samoa’s rural villages. METI also aims to expand the number of Taiala to 50 who will work across 50 of Samoa’s 300 villages. (Interview with Walter Vermeulen).

In 2012 – 2013, COL supported the training of the 8 METI staff as Life Skills Coaches which contributed to their achieving a qualification recognised by the Samoa National Qualifications Authority. Their training continued in September 2013 with mentoring of the group as they delivered cascaded training to the Taiala.

In January 2014 METI’s internal team of trainers were trained to write self-instructional materials. They in turn would work with the Taiala, based on the training they received. The focus of the workshop was on producing a self-instructional manual on Permaculture that is targeted at the Taiala entitled: *Introduction to Permaculture: A self instructional manual for TAIALA.*

The intended workshop outputs were to include a profile of learners in order to inform the materials design; a course blueprint and the Life Skills Coach Training Manual to be used with the Taiala. The workshop also focused on clarifying the difference between copyright and OERs and introduce Creative Commons licensing as well as raise awareness about gender-sensitive writing.
The workshop concluded with a Life Skills Coach Training Manual. METI also reportedly produced a draft Self Instructional Manual for Taiala: Introduction to Perma-Culture as part of their deliverables. The consultant provided support to METI through to the end of February 2014 by reviewing their printed course materials and providing feedback for improvement (Afamasaga, 2014). The benefit to METI of having the Life Skills Coach Training Manual is that previously, all the collective wisdom and training content of METI was held by the Director. They are now in a stronger position for the future with resource based learning.

The M&E Consultant had access to these manuals which were accessibly written, with learning objectives clearly articulated and concepts clearly explained.

In September 2014, COL hired a consultant to review the existing materials, design and facilitate further capacity building on instructional design, and review the revised learning materials after the team had edited and developed them.

The training workshop reviewed the Permaculture Programme which comprises 12 lessons relating to the various permaculture principles and the development of sustainable and self-sufficient agricultural ecosystems. The Healthy Living Programme is a two hour seminar which seeks to address the increasing threat in Samoa of non-communicable diseases (NCDs) – particularly diabetes, obesity and hypertension by encouraging participants to adopt a wholefood, plant based diet.

During the workshop, participants were able to make significant progress in revising the materials for the healthy living seminar and they were able to revise 3 of the 13 lessons in the Permaculture programme. Following the workshop, they completed the revision of the full course, the consultant carried out a review and provided feedback. This course is now available as an OER on the COL website.

According to the consultant, the METI training team demonstrated their ability to design and develop print based learning materials. The materials provided following the workshop, demonstrated the team’s ability to design good learning materials with a variety of engaging activities. However, retaining skills and knowledge used infrequently will always be a challenge (Pickering, 2015). She also recommended that they develop a better version control and storing of the master file system; that they
resort to direct English translation of Samoan versions and that the METI team continues to apply their instructional design skills to developing learning resources for the Taiala.

An interview with the METI Executive Director, Dr Walter Vermeulen suggests that the training and materials development process is focused on using print-based learning materials and does not at this stage incorporate new education media and digital technologies. However COL supported social media training for NGOs in Samoa, including METI in 2014, which had reportedly not been incorporated in subsequent training nor have they been used by METI staff who participated in the workshop. Also, the Healthy Living seminar materials had formerly consisted of PowerPoint slides with commentary which suggests some use of digital technologies in the training workshop with METI staff.

He also indicated that they have received support for the expansion to 50 villages from USAID. For him, working with COL and particularly with Dr Alison Mead Richardson, the COL ES, has been ‘a very gratifying experience’.

It seems evident that COL’s support to METI has laid the initial foundation for them to expand their training programme and that they have been able to do so successfully so far by bringing another partner on board in the form of USAID. COL support also coincided with support to METI by the US Embassy for their health programme focused on obesity control and the prevention or reversal of non-communicable diseases (NCD). On the basis of success of these interventions, METI will be able to reach one sixth of the total number of villages in Samoa through their 50-village support from USAID. In this sense, COL's support over the past three years has been catalytic and strategic for both METI and COL.

At this stage, much of the work has focused on putting systems in place such as the training materials and getting the Taiala trained. The next steps which will focus on expanding the programme, will need to integrate monitoring and evaluation in order to ascertain the effect of the programme on growing the capacity for sustainable development and livelihoods in the villages.

5.1.2.6 VANUATU: Livelihood Skills Training for Women and Girls with VRDTCA

COL has been working with the Vanuatu Rural Development & Training Centres Association (VRDTCA), an umbrella organisation comprising a network of rural training centres (RTCs) that offer livelihoods training to rural youth in Vanuatu.

In 2013 and 2014, COL contracted two consultants to facilitate Livelihood Skills Training for Women workshops with the VRDTCA to develop a flexible course and related materials on livelihood skills mainly for girls and young women who have dropped out of school or who are unemployed. Here the outputs produced included a programme blueprint and a schedule for finalizing the course programme and delivery. The workshop also produced a SWOT analysis, leaner profiles and its implications for course design; learner a draft budget and an analysis of the challenges. In addition, materials development for four core skills areas: cooking, sewing, fabric decoration and handicraft based on competency standards set by the Vanuatu National Training Council. A Team of three people from VRDTCA participated in the Pacific Regional TVET Workshop in Fiji in March 2014. By May 2014, the Director of VRDTCA announced that the programme had been launched at Morobian RTC with 20 girls
and that they intended to offer the programme in flexible mode which will enable them to recruit many more learners (Isaacs & Mead Richardson, 2014c).

The COL ES reports that during late 2014 and early 2015, core funding for VRDTCA from NZ Aid came to an end. The organisation was guided through a process of review and drafting of a new Strategic Plan with an NZAID consultant. This culminated in the resignation of the Director in March 2015. The future of VRDTCA is at this stage, uncertain. The ES is in contact with NZ Aid in Vanuatu regarding the status of VRDTCA.

**5.1.2.7 KIRIBATI: TVET Outer Islands Strategic Plan**

COL partnered with the Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) Technical & Vocational Education & Training Sector Strengthening Programme (TVETSSP) to provide technical support for the development of a TVET delivery strategy in the ‘outer islands’ of Kiribati. The technical support assumed the form of one full day workshop and three half day workshops for the staff of the Ministry of Labour & Human Resource Development (MLHRD), TVET institutions and other stakeholders, site visits to three TVET Institutes and informal discussions with individuals and enterprises in South Tarawa.

The first workshop produced a SWOT assessment of the readiness of the MLHRD and Institutes to take TVET beyond South Tarawa and the second workshop led to a focus on an Outer Islands Development Plan, as one of several plans for implementing the approved Strategy which participants believed, would accelerate progress. The workshops discussed the main features of such a draft plan. It was estimated that the process of finalizing a Plan would be concluded for this phase of the work, in May 2014. The COL consultant (Sayer, 2014) recommended that the COL Planning Guide can be used by the group involved in the workshop to support a more structured planning programme and that COL provide further assistance with course planning by supporting the adaptation of existing OERs for Kiribati. He further recommended that COL facilitates collaboration with USP as part of the process towards establishing the new PACFOLD Centre, which will be housed within USP’s Centre for Vocational and Continuing Education (CVCE) (Sayer, 2014, Isaacs and Mead Richardson 2014c).

After the COL TVSD ES visited Kiribati in May 2014, she concluded that COL will need to partner with Aus Aid's programme team to make a contribution to TVET reform programmes. At this stage, no further work has been done with Kiribati partners.
5.1.2.8 FIJI: Pacific TAFE: Design of Pacific TVET Teacher Training Programme as OER and Delivery of Certificate in Community Development

COL has been working with the Centre for Vocational and Continuing Education (CVCE) based at the University of the South Pacific (USP). The CVCE was renamed in January 2015 as USP Pacific Technical And Further Education (Pacific TAFE) which provides vocational & professional programmes and short courses for post-secondary and mature students. In 2013 - 2014, COL contracted Michael Coghlan from Federation Training (which was the former Gipps TAFE) in Australia, to work with the CVCE to design a new Pacific TVET teacher training qualification. The new programme aims to develop training materials that can be made available as OER.

He worked with two USP staff and decided to adapt the Training and Assessment (TAA) qualification from the Australian Training Assessment and Education (TAE) training package and agreed to design a course focused on the needs of learners and industry instead of focusing on securing accreditation. The process concluded with an action plan towards launching the new course in February 2015. He made several recommendations:

- That a new certificate course in workplace training that comprises a combination of units from the Australian Certificate IV in Training and Assessment (TAA) and the existing USP Certificate in Workplace Training and Assessment, be developed;
- That the facilitators who would deliver the course undertake the Certificate IV in TAA themselves and be given time off from normal duties to participate in the course which was taking place in June 2014;
- That further consultant support be given to facilitating lecturers in adapting and assembling course materials in Moodle; and
- That consideration be given to providing participating facilitators experience of communication tools in Moodle in order to better support distance learners; (Coghlan, 2014).

This programme was submitted to the USP Senate for approval in June 2014. Course writing started and the consultant provided QA inputs to ensure the quality of the materials. The first 2 courses have been completed and the programme launched in February 2015 as planned with 30 learners. The consultant is continuing to work with the course team to quality assure the remaining courses.

Between December 2014 and February 2015, COL supported the review of the Certificate IV in TAA. Two courses were completed and two more will be finalized in April 2015 (Coghlan, 2015).

During 2014 and 2015, Pacific TAFE has been delivering the flexible learning Certificate in Community Development (CCD) which they developed with COL support in 2013. This Certificate is articulated to Level 3 on the Fiji National Qualifications Framework. The programme enhances students’ knowledge regarding community development issues and challenges both current and emerging, appropriate community development processes, approaches, strategies and skills to enable them to be effective community workers, trainers and leaders in terms of addressing and coping with these community development issues and challenges. The three courses have been made available as OER by USP – these
can be found on the COL website. Twenty six participants from 3 Pacific countries were enrolled in the course in 2014 and 37 from 6 countries in 2015.

5.1.2.9 NAURU: Evaluation of TVSD Skills Training

In this programme period, COL commissioned a study of a skills training programme which was co-funded by COL and the Nauru government in 2011 for youth and community members on Working with Concrete which also included a Literacy and Numeracy for Basic Trades course. The study included the views of youth and community stakeholders about the skills programme. It also tried to ascertain whether women and men had different experiences of the course, reflecting an interest to reflect a gendered perspective on skills development.

The researcher reflected on her own experience in conducting this study as being one which opened up a new pathway to academia for her and how she claimed 'authentic authority' in the research process (Teleni, 2014).

The report provides an overview of the project and the views expressed by various stakeholders - the course participants, community members and trainers. It highlights a number of key findings, some of which include that a high number of trainees considered literacy/numeracy and concreting very important and relevant to their lives and livelihood.

The impact that these courses have had on the lives of the youth were such that it supported improved livelihood, enabled them to find jobs and for some women participants, some entered traditionally male dominated sectors such as the building industry. One such woman participant reportedly built a pig sty.

Whilst there is consistency in reporting on gender differences throughout the study report, the researcher indicated that gender difference was not an important part of the study. Nevertheless it provides interesting insights on the gender division of labour from the perspective of the participants. Some women felt that the work was too heavy and more suitable for men and other women who found employment in the building sector reflected the challenge of being treated differently on account of being a woman.

The value of being taught in the vernacular enabled the participants who 'could not read or do math' to related to Math through real life examples such as the calculations involved in throwing darts (Teleni, 2014).

Youth being taught how to work with concrete in Nauru.
5.1.2.10 PAPUA NEW GUINEA: Capacity Building for FOL Unit in the Department of Education

COL has worked with the TVET Wing of the Department of Education in Papua New Guinea (PNG) on their flexible and open learning strategies throughout this three year programme plan. COL supported capacity building workshops in October 2013 and 2014. Since then they have established a Flexible Open Learning (FOL) Unit to manage the introduction of FOL in public TVET institutions at different levels. COL's TVSD Initiative supported the strategy development of the FOL Unit; the development of job descriptions; supported capacity building in management of TVET systems; and supported FOL course development.

From 22 September to 3 October 2014, COL supported two capacity building workshops which were facilitated by Clint Smith, a COL consultant. Remote support for the development of the course materials was provided until the end of November.

The first workshop was five days’ long attended by 16 teachers from 7 TVET institutions. Here the focus was on designing learning materials for FOL and making the first short TVET FOL courses ready for delivery in 2015. These teachers prepared a Learner’s Workbook for a total of 12 courses of which four were capable of being made ready as short courses; and a further five needed substantial additional work. According to Smith (2015), three were unlikely to reach satisfactory level. This experience led him to conclude that the design and development by teachers of full FOL courses for qualification (national certificates) is not a sustainable option for TVET. While the COL workshop teachers have increased their skills in writing learning materials and their understanding of FOL, they will need to find and adapt existing OER materials from other sources to be able to meet future needs (Smith, 2015).

The second five-day workshop involved a core group of 14 senior managers from the TVET Head Office plus a strong representation from Heads of all TVET provider types (colleges, vocational centres and schools). Their task was to develop an Implementation Guide for FOL.

They made very substantial progress towards developing policy guidelines and an operating framework for FOL. With a launch target of June 2015, work groups identified key issues and challenges in scheduling, learning materials, provider guidelines, resourcing and assessment.

- Several priority actions were agreed:
- Develop TVET FOL publishing templates to provide a standard format and style for FOL materials
- Identify a shortlist of 10 TVET courses where external learning materials are available and can be adapted for the PNG context.
- Complete and publish FOL Implementation Guidelines for TVET providers.

A TVET FOL Working Group with a Basecamp was established to provide collaboration and follow-up beyond the workshop and to coordinate tasks and monitor progress. This is an important step as there are many competing factions within the TVET Division and there is now a wider ownership of FOL than just the 2-person unit.
Smith (2015) recommends that direct assistance be provided to experienced instructional designers to help teachers complete the four most advanced courses from the COL FOL Workshops, using the new TVET FOL Learner’s Workbook template, by March 2015; that consultancy support be provided to the TVET head Office curriculum officers to help them select a shortlist of FOL courses; and that a second System Management workshop be organised in April to support the implementation of the first TVET FOL courses in June 2015.

The consultant also reports that new staff are being recruited to the Colleges of Flexible Learning Officers (FLOs) and that to support the writers, he was able to secure free skills training material from TAFE Frontiers (Smith, 2015).

5.1.2.11 TUVALU: Workshop with Stakeholders

The COL ES visited Tuvalu in September 2014. During her visit she met with various officials and stakeholders and facilitated a half day workshop with 25 participants from TVSD stakeholder organisations: the Tuvalu Health Ministry, NGOs, Immigration Agencies focused on Gender Equality, Faith-based Secondary school, the Public Service Commission. This workshop discussed a range of issues including:

- The range of many TVSD stakeholders in Tuvalu
- Their interest in a national certificate based on short courses
- Recognition of Prior Learning as a feature of a national certificate
- Working with SPBEQ on a quality framework
- Support from DFAT to schools in the form of grants for electronic equipment and that most schools have a PC, laptop and projector and some have photocopiers
- That NZAID may be supporting TVET in schools
- That the Fiji government gives 50% fees subsidy for Tuvalu students at Fiji National University
- The need for employment pathways for students by bridging the needs of Education and Labour
- The various COL programmes

She also did a radio interview on Flexible TVSD and COL's programmes. Her visit concluded with idea discussion with the Director of Education and her team regarding the piloting of a new island-based TVSD programme for youth in Tuvalu (Mead Richardson, 2014f).

5.1.2.12 SOLOMON ISLANDS: Planning Workshop for DE Diploma in Construction Management Team

The COL TVSD ES also visited the Solomon Islands on 2 October 2014 following the participation of a team of three people participating in the Pacific Flexible TVET Workshop in Fiji in May 2014. Here she facilitated a planning workshop with 3 staff for the Distance Education Diploma in Construction Management Team at the Solomon Islands National University (Mead Richardson, 2014g).
5.1.3 CAPACITY BUILDING IN THE CARIBBEAN

So far in the current three year plan, there has been less TVSD focus on activities in the Caribbean than in other Commonwealth regions. Continued support was planned in 2014-2015 for the strategic objectives of existing partners St Vincent & the Grenadines Community College and UTech FELS. In addition, new partners had been identified at HEART/NTA in Jamaica and the College of the Bahamas. Support for monitoring and evaluation was originally requested from HEART but this was changed to a request for eLearning capacity building. The College of the Bahamas requested support for strategic planning for their new Distance Education Unit.

At a regional level, COL partnered with the Caribbean Association of National Training Authorities (CANTA) to introduce the flexible and blended model of TVET and to plan for a stronger Caribbean regional focus in the coming 6 year programme plan.

5.1.3.1 CARIBBEAN REGION: CANTA

COL responded to a request by Dr Wayne Wesley to support a regional workshop on developing a Caribbean strategy for flexible and efficient TVET systems. This workshop took place from 17 – 20 February 2015 and was co-facilitated by the COL ES and consultant George Herd. The planned outcomes were that participants would understand the benefits of Flexible and Blended (FaB) approaches; identify country and regional barriers; and initiate relevant changes in their respective contexts. There were 21 participants from National Training Authorities, TVET Institutions and other regional agencies including Caribbean Examinations Council and Association of Caribbean Tertiary Institutions.

Institutions from the 10 countries that participated are in the process of completing FSD readiness surveys which will be used to identify strategic areas of intervention and partnership.

According to the COL ES, possible regional TVSD activities for further follow up include:

- reviving the regional in-service TVET teacher training programme
- online training to support the FaB model
- an online community of practice to promote sharing and the development of OER
- OER course development to CVQ standards in specific vocational areas
- online assessor training for CVQs
5.1.3.2 JAMAICA: Capacity Building in Online Course Development & Blended Online Teaching and Learning at UTech FELS

In Jamaica, COL has been working with UTech FELS since 2012. Here the focus has been on support for capacity development in blended online teaching and learning.

In May 2013, COL supported a five-day workshop on blended learning for FELS staff. Participants gained experience in writing for online audiences, developing planning documents and addressing quality assurance for blended learning. The workshop also included training on Moodle (Norman, 2013, Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2013b).

With COL support, FELS also commenced a fully-online Post-Graduate Diploma in Education (PGDE) to teachers on the island of Montserrat (Norman, 2013). This Diploma is defined by the following:

- An online instructional approach to the delivery of the course;
- All modules are delivered online except for the practicum;
- With the exception of the practicum, each module is delivered using appropriate technologies;
- The graded practicum and teaching assessment components are also important features of the course, involving UTech assessors visiting, observing and assessing participants’ lessons and providing requisite feedback (FELS, 2015).

In May 2014, COL contracted Sandy Hirtz to support staff at FELS with planning, designing and implementing a blended online course. The workshop covered a range of instructional design and Moodle skills. Participants developed action plans for blended or online teaching and began to implement these plans during the workshop. Once participants completed tutorials and assignments, they were awarded a badge. The purpose of badging was to assess each individual’s progress to demonstrate how badges can be used as alternative form of assessment. Nine staff completed the training (Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2014c).

Hirtz (2014b) suggests that the intended outcome of the workshop to strengthen capacity in blended online learning and teaching, was met successfully, albeit with only 9 participants, despite the challenges faced by the workshop. Continued support was also available to participants in the form of an online course in Instructional Design which includes all the workshop materials and resources.

A recent report reflects the progress FELS has made towards adopting blended online course delivery. By 2014, FELS had 177 modules on their LMS compared to 95 in 2011-2012. FELS also increased its number of lecturers from 60 in December 2014 to 69 in February 2015 and their number of active online courses from 56 in December 2014 to 76 in February 2015. They also increased their number of students enrolled in online courses from 2170 in December 2014 to 2600 in February 2015. (FELS, 2015).
Figure 6: Data on the number of learners that have studied FELS online courses. September 2014 – March 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Students Enrolled (student counted multiple times if in another course)</th>
<th>Total Number of Students Enrolled (student counted once)</th>
<th>Active Students in Active Courses (student counted multiple times if in another course)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>September 29 2014</td>
<td>1704</td>
<td>1396</td>
<td>1546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2 2014</td>
<td>3041</td>
<td>2182</td>
<td>2594</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 1 2015</td>
<td>3849</td>
<td>2603</td>
<td>3075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 2 2015</td>
<td>4926</td>
<td>2909</td>
<td>4284</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 7: Data on the number of learners that have studied FELS online courses 2: September 2014 – March 2015

Figure 6 and Figure 7 shows that the number of students enrolled in FELS online courses, have increased since September 2014 and that students who are active in their online courses have also increased over the same period (Office of Distance Learning of the University of Technology, 2015)

A case study of one of the female teachers at FELS, Ms Michelle Stewart-Mckoy who participated in COL-supported training workshops in 2012 and 2014 reveals that she has been using the templates provided to her by COL and applied problem-solving/project-based learning and teaching in her classes
and she has been integrating educational media in 8 courses that she teaches both at FELS and the University of West Indies:

“I have been using the templates consistently and have been using the resources provided and extending that by enrolling in other sessions, tutorials and workshops of a similar nature. I engage more in small groups and paired work and less on whole class lecturing and I am more inclined to incorporate problem-based/project-based activities to develop students 21st century skills”.

She uses Moodle, Skype, blogs, wikis, PowerPoint and iSpring software to create interactive quizzes and lessons. She has also incorporated digital badges, electronic stickers and mini certificates in her learning sessions. She also uses OERs from Merlot and OER Commons.

She experienced initial reserved behavior from her students but they have later expressed their satisfaction with her use of educational media in the classroom and have shown improved results. She also believes that her use of educational media has improved her efficiency and effectiveness as a teacher. Her biggest challenge is that some of her students do not access the Moodle platform but she has created a parallel learning environment to accommodate such students (COL, 2015).

The case study write up of Ms Stewart-McKoy reflects a teacher who is passionate about teaching and how she uses the resources at her disposal to be creative and innovative in her teaching practice.

5.1.3.3 JAMAICA: Capacity Building at HEART/NTA

The Human Employment and Resources Training (HEART) Trust National Training Agency (NTA) is a training organisation established in 1982 in Jamaica. It operates a network of 29 TVET institutions offering Level 1 to Level 3 programmes to provide job-ready training for entry level workers. They are trying to expand access through eLearning but are facing some challenges in staff capacity building of eLearning. (HEART Trust, 2014, Mead-Richardson, 2014a). Their Mission Statement indicates the need to promote for flexible forms of TVET:

The HEART Trust/NTA is committed to the systematic design, development and delivery of an integrated, flexible and responsive Technical, Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system enabling a productive workforce for national priorities and global competitiveness.

The TVSD Education Specialist contracted a consultant in February 2014 to provide support with online materials development to strengthen of their online distance learning programme in order to increase access to and improve quality in their programmes. Later that month she visited HEART/NTA to strengthen the partnership and to learn more about the needs for a flexible TVET system in Jamaica. She facilitated a workshop on COL partnerships, M&E and flexible TVET for 24 HEART agency and institutional managers during her visit.
As a result of the eLearning training, HEART reported that there were more than 47 eLearning courses in development throughout the HEART system by March 2014. Measures were put in place to ensure there was no duplication of course development and online resources are shared (Hirtz, 2014a).

As a result of the Hirtz eLearning training COL then contracted Brian Sayer to facilitate a five-day workshop in June 2014, on course design for flexible learning for instructors and programme support staff at HEART Trust/NTA’s network of training institutions and central support services. The workshop was designed to support the development of flexible learning programmes by this group of instructors and specialists, and to assist them to cascade their new knowledge about course design to other instructors within their institutions and units.

The participants completed programme specifications for twelve programmes which they planned to implement from September 2014, including a train-the-trainers programme on course design for flexible learning. The consultant stated that the workshop participants displayed high levels of competence and confidence. He recommended that COL and HEART further explore the potential of a stronger partnership; that HEART managers prioritise some programmes for development from those planned during the workshop, and draw out the required staff from teaching to develop these programmes as case studies; that COL and HEART consider organising executive workshops across the HEART network to build awareness amongst managers and assist them to make strategic plans for flexible learning and that the small team involved in designing the programme should complete the programme specification quickly for LDSS and COL to consider how it could be implemented and supported (Sayer, 2014b, Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2014c).

COL then contracted George Herd to facilitate two workshops with HEART Trust/NTA: The first was a consultation process with relevant staff on the implementation of a proposed new model for Quality Assurance in TVET and the second explored best practice in the introduction of more flexible systems of TVET. Herd (2014) made several recommendations on the way forward including amongst others, that HEART Trust/NTA develop a complementary strategy on TVET qualifications in ways that align with the National Qualifications Framework and complement the strategic location of TVET in the education sector;

He also made recommendations on the flexibility of the TVET system. These include amongst others, that HEART Trust/NTA undertakes an exercise where responsibilities related to operational autonomy are more clearly defined, in an attempt to progress towards more autonomous institutions; and that it considers funding mechanisms that can support institutions to become more autonomous.

In September 2014, COL contracted Ed Du Vivier to assist with strengthening the capacity of HEART Trust NTA to develop their ODFL Policy in October to December 2014. This work has been taken on by a team of HEART officers but progress has been slow. A draft was provided in March 2015 with a final draft to be reviewed by the COL consultant in April.
In February 2015, the TVSD ES visited HEART Trust NTA. She and COL consultant, Brian Sayer, met with officials from the HEART Trust/NTA Community Training Initiative (CTI) to plan a collaborative project to support the development of flexible community level skills training and develop sustainable Community Training Organisations (CTOs) that will expand access to TVET (Mead Richardson, 2015a).

Sayer outlines initial ideas and conceptual framework for a pilot project that can be scaled and sustained by CTOs that are responsive to the needs of the local community. COL and HEART Trust NTA reached agreement on the overall purpose, project process and priorities for capacity building and resource mobilization. The pilot project will extend from 2015 to 2018.

Sayer highlights the complexity of this work and makes recommendations to both parties about the way forward. These include inter alia:

- That a clear partnership agreement be developed between HEART Trust NTA and COL;
- That a clear project plan be developed;
- That CTIs and ATOs be invited to register through a short simple application process;
- That COL clarifies the resources it can invest in the project; and
- That COL prepares a draft M&E plan. (Sayer, 2015)

Based on the above, it is evident that the relationship between COL and HEART Trust NTA has strengthened and that COL is making a strategic investment in the institution in view of its role in the national TVET system in Jamaica and its potential to deliver an inclusive and equitable TVET offering particularly to disadvantaged communities.

5.1.3.4 ST VINCENT & THE GRENADINES: Capacity building in eLearning for SVGCC

St Vincent and the Grenadines Community College (SVGCC) is an amalgamation of 4 divisions into one college in 2005. It has a Division of Technical & Vocational Education and has approximately 2000 students.

In this programme period, COL has continued to partner with SVGCC because of their strategic objective to offer distance elearning programmes to increase access to young people, particularly those living in the grenadine Islands. In the previous programme plan, COL supported elearning training and SVGCC established the eCollege team to support the development of elearning at the College. The COL ES visited in February 2014 when she engaged with teachers and met with senior management to facilitate sessions on planning and managing flexible learning. Here it was agreed that SVGCC will develop online courses on Moodle and move towards whole programmes being offered through eLearning. She also presented a session with all SVGCC staff on OER which generated keen interest.
Following the visit, COL hired a consultant to supported Moodle Admin training and advanced eLearning training for 25 Master Trainers and an eCollege Team at SVGCC which took place in May 2014. He made a number of recommendations to SVGCC including that the eCollege team needs a structured approach to teacher professional development; that they need a policy on OERs and an Acceptable Use Policy; and that they should continue to invest in ICT infrastructure (Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2014c).

The consultant re-visited SVGCC in February 2015 and according to Herd (2015) the College has made good progress in the development of eLearning and the use of Moodle across its four divisions, although little progress was made in developing new course provision targeting non-traditional learners. The consultant identified that this is an area where SVGCC could provide additional educational services to the community and also increase income for the college. Whilst there is growing awareness of Moodle, Blackboard Collaborate and the value of OERs, limited specific actions have been taken in this respect. He found evidence of YouTube in use for Mathematics and Language learning and the use of free textbooks and PowerPoint by teachers. A draft ICT policy was also produced by SVGCC which was reviewed by Herd as well. However, like with many institutions, reliable connectivity to the Internet remained a challenge which was highlighted by all the teachers he spoke to. He recommended that SVGCC’s eCollege team engage in business process re-engineering of their campuses and their use of ICT and that they should develop an annual operational plan. He also recommended further capacity building on the use of PowerPoint and sourcing OERs.

5.1.3.5 BAHAMAS: Distance Education Strategic Planning at the COB

The COL TVSD ES visited the Bahamas for two days in February 2014 to learn about the College of the Bahamas (COB) and to give input to their strategic planning process. This followed on from a series of email discussions and a review of draft distance education policy and strategy documents. Over the two days, she met with the managers of the Continuing Education & Extension Services Department to give input to their draft Strategic Plan for the Distance Education Unit and to discuss possible COL support for expanding access through ODFL to programmes at the College of The Bahamas.

An interview with Edward Bethel from COB suggests that the COB had worked with different Initiatives at COL and that the TVSD Initiative in particular influenced their development of a draft policy on distance education. This draft policy makes reference to COL.
5.2. CONSOLIDATED FINDINGS: 2012 TO 2015

By March 2015, the TVSD Initiative has worked with 64 institutions in 22 countries in Africa, Asia the Caribbean and the Pacific over the three years: 2012 to 2015. Figure 8 shows that the TVSD Initiative has exceeded its outcome targets in terms of number of countries and institutions reached.; that partners together reached 6,694 new learners in new non formal courses and 8,272 new learners in new flexible core programmes. TVSD Partners produced 158 new courses or courses that are in the process of being developed and 17 Open Education Resources. Furthermore, 45 institutions or organisations have new technology-enhanced course components in use.

Figure 8: TVSD Cumulative Results 2012-2013-2014: Summary of Outcomes Achieved Institutions and New ODL Courses and Curriculum Content 1 July 2012 to 31 March 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regions</th>
<th>Countries where we have achieved outcomes</th>
<th>Institutions or organisations starting or strengthening use of technology and ODL in TVSD</th>
<th>Number of new learners on new non-formal courses</th>
<th>Number of new learners on new flexible core progs since 2012</th>
<th>New or improved courses in development or in use</th>
<th>As OER</th>
<th>Institutions/organisations with new technology enhanced curriculum components in use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3,103</td>
<td>3,580</td>
<td>80 Formal 10 Total 27</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3529</td>
<td>4610</td>
<td>0 Formal 104 Total 104</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caribbean</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4610</td>
<td>0 Formal 104 Total 104</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>7 Formal 20 Total 27</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>6,694</td>
<td>8,272</td>
<td>104 Formal 134 Total 158</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3Y Target</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 9 considers the outputs achieved between 1 July 2014 and 31 March 2015.
### Figure 9: Outputs Achieved 1 July 2014 to 31 March 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategic Area</th>
<th>Targeted Outputs (Year 3)</th>
<th>Outputs as at June 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>PAN COMMONWEALTH</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPACITY:</strong> Online Flexible Skills Development Course</td>
<td>Revision and adaptation of online Flexible Skills Development course</td>
<td>Updated FSD Online Course and version contextualised for the Caribbean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ASIA</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MATERIALS:</strong> DE Certificate in Community Development</td>
<td>SRCK India: CCD Programme Handbook and CCD Tutor Handbook are in use</td>
<td>4 courses in final draft form by March 2014. Scheduled for completion before June 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPACITY:</strong> New Courses</td>
<td>DAM, Bangladesh: 5 new OER training courses offered by NGOs in Bangladesh being accessed by 535 learners</td>
<td>5 courses developed and in use and available as OER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DAM, Bangladesh: 3 new courses in Basic Trades</td>
<td>3 courses in Basic Trades in development in print and video format</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNIVOTEC, Sri Lanka: Online Teacher Training Course</td>
<td>6 courses developed; workshop delivered attended by 12 lecturers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PACIFIC</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPACITY:</strong> Training in Flexible TVET and Materials Development</td>
<td>TVET Wing of the Department of Education, PNG: Capacity building in flexible TVET systems and learning materials</td>
<td>2 workshops; 15 trained in Flexible TVET systems; 18 trained in materials development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MATERIALS:</strong> Materials Development</td>
<td>METI, Samoa: Produce instructional manuals to support work of the Taiala in rural villages</td>
<td>2 manuals developed: on Permaculture and Life Skills Coaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPACITY:</strong> Instructional Design Training</td>
<td>METI, Samoa: Instructional Design Training</td>
<td>7 METI staff trained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPACITY:</strong> Social Media Training</td>
<td>NGOs in Samoa: Social Media Workshop for Samoa NGOS: METI, NUS, Samoa National Youth Council and Teachers Association</td>
<td>10 Participants Trained from 3 organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MATERIALS:</strong> Course Development</td>
<td>USP: Design of Pacific TVET Teacher Training programme as OER</td>
<td>2 courses written by March 2015 and another 2 due for completion before June 2015. Three courses from Certificate in Community Development made available as OER.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All Pacific Partner Countries: Updated materials Literacy and Numeracy in Basic Trades Course</td>
<td>Revised and updated course materials for Literacy &amp; Numeracy in Basic Trades course including audio content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CAPACITY:</strong> Planning &amp; Managing Flexible Learning</td>
<td>Pacific Regional Training Planning and Managing Flexible Learning</td>
<td>26 TVET teachers from a range of partner institutions in 9 countries; 17 new flexible courses were in development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Across the four regions, COL worked with 64 institutions in 22 countries who, over the past three years, have either started, or strengthened, or started and strengthened the use of technologies and ODL in TVSD. The reason for the significant increase in the number of institutions reached relative to the target of 20 that was set, is because COL worked with a wide range of institutions in Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific, many of whom by 2015 had ‘started’ to use technologies and ODL in delivering TVSD but who may have concluded their partnership with COL because the specific assignment or project had ended; or COL’s partnership with such institutions could not be sustained due to local complexities. This means that whilst COL worked with a number of institutions, not all institutional partnerships were sustained over the three year period. COL’s work in Vanuatu and Kiribati are examples of the latter.

6. **ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS**

Based on an analysis of outcomes achieved over the three year period 2012 to 2015, the evaluation found that the TVSD Initiative has been effective, efficient and relevant for its partners. It also found that the Initiative is designed for sustainability and has promoted gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls with some TVSD partners.

6.1. **EFFECTIVENESS: How effectively has the TVSD Initiative contributed to COL’s Impact Statement?**

The effectiveness of outcomes achieved in **Africa**, through the INVEST Africa programme is analysed in Isaacs (2015).

COL’s work in each of the three regions outside of Africa, produced outcomes that also reflect that nature, number and size of the institutions and organisations that COL partnered with, each with varying capacities to deliver on the support provided by COL. In **Asia**, COL worked in five institutions in three countries with a strong focus on supporting local and remote communities and partnering. Through this work, the TVSD Initiative and its partners achieved the production of course materials which integrated FaB approaches in their design. Five of the twenty seven courses that were produced, were OER including in local languages. Course development was targeted at TVET teachers in Sri Lanka, local entrepreneurs in rural communities in Bangladesh and community skills trainers in India. The work done by DAM went beyond the course development process and included cascaded training in livelihood skills.
of local entrepreneurs, many of whom were women and who harnessed these skills to start and sustain local businesses since 2013. This represents a good practice case study worthy of further exploration because it highlights not only the production of OERs but also the role they served in extending reach and growing livelihood opportunities for communities considered to be marginalised. Moreover, it also represents an important contribution to COL’s impact statement, even though currently, the political situation in Bangladesh has already disrupted further the ongoing work of DAM.

Unlike in Asia, COL has worked more at a macro level on strategic issues with regional institutions like CANTA in the Caribbean, as well as on Flexible ODL policy and strategy issues in a few key institutions in the Bahamas (with the College of the Bahamas), Jamaica (with UTech FELS and more recently with HEART/NTA Trust. Its work with St Vincent and the Grenadines (with SVGCC) was focused more on eLearning capacity building. However over the three year period, COL worked with 26 institutions in the three countries, supported the development of 104 formal courses which were not produced as OER and 25 out of the 26 institutions had technology enhanced curriculum components in use.

The effectiveness of the outcomes of COL’s work in this region can also be gauged by the support the TVSD Initiative gave to the review or development of ODL policies and strategies (such as with CANTA, the HEART/NTA Trust and the College of the Bahamas). In this respect, this work has greater systemic and strategic value in the short to medium term because they put in place enabling environments at institutional, country and regional levels to support and guide the implementation of FaB learning and teaching approaches. Importantly too, the workshops that COL hosted with its partners and the technical support it provides in the form of either the COL ES or consultants, also served to raise awareness and build skills in policy and strategy formation. Here the policy development experience with the HEART/NTA Trust is worth further development and support.

In view of the HEART/NTA’s role in the national Jamaican TVET system given that it operates as a network of 29 TVET institutions, COL’s role has also included support for a new model of Quality Assurance for TVET and capacity building in course design. Here too the outcomes achieved have strategic value in that they can reach many institutions in one country and given the location of Jamaica in the region, can also have potential influence at a regional level.

In the Pacific however, COL worked with 19 institutions across nine island countries at institutional/organisational, country and regional levels, two of which had technology enhanced curriculum components in use by March 2015. The latter includes METI and USP and 6 of the 27 courses developed are now available as OER. COL’s institutional partners in the Pacific were more diverse relative to the other regions. Perhaps among the most significant is its work with METI where COL support resulted not only in awareness raising and skills development of METI’s Taiala, but also the development of training materials such as the Life Skills Coaching course and the production of self-instructional manuals as OER.
6.1.1 What is the nature of changes to policies that were adopted in support of FaB approaches?

In the Africa region, COL provided technical support for FaB policy development in the form of online engagement on institutional policy development and a dedicated policy workshop facilitated by an expert consultant and making consultants available to facilitate both online conversations and onsite visits to INVEST institutions. The nature of policy changes in INVEST institutions is discussed in the INVEST Africa 2014 and 2015 M&E reports. The nature of organisational structures, infrastructural investments and pedagogical shifts are also discussed here (Isaacs, 2015, Isaacs and Mead Richardson, 2014).

Compared to the Africa region, COL support for institutional FaB-related policies and strategies, have been more targeted and limited to fewer institutions and organisations where there was receptiveness to policy and strategy support. COL provided technical support in Kiribati, for a process of policy change. This assumed the form of a workshop on ODFL policy for outer island TVET delivery.

According to the partner at KIT/MLHRD in Kiribati, Antoine Barnaat:

"COL’s investment is appropriate and represents a hands-on partnership. It is value for money for donors and the community"

Barnaat also says that he has drawn on COL's experience with the INVEST Africa programme and that some of their methodologies is a validation of the work that they are doing in Kiribati. Here he was referring specifically to the involvement of stakeholders in the development of policy by allowing them the space to develop drafts through interactive debate and discussion in the workshops.

Sayer (2014) highlights an important point about the process in Kiribati. He emphasizes that COL needs to appreciate that this process of introducing ODFL for TVET is still in its infancy in Kiribati because the concepts and ideas were new to many of the workshop participants and contrasted sharply with that which they learned through formal accredited training. Thus the nature of policy development and change in Kiribati was focused first and foremost on awareness raising among the decision makers. It suggests that in the case of Kiribati, it is still at the beginning stages of policy development.

COL also provided the HEART Trust/NTA with strategic, policy-related support for the promotion of FAB and ODL. This assumes the form of a draft Flexible Learning Policy which states as one of its key objectives to encourage and support diverse systems, structures and approaches that are learner-centered and enable equitable and inclusive access to quality TVET options. In addition, it also states that its objectives are to:

“Facilitate capacity building in the design, development, delivery and continuous improvement of flexible learning for academic staff, technical staff and administrators; “

to “Promote a culture of quality in, and acceptance of flexible learning; “ and

to “Utilise current and emerging flexible technologies to enrich learning experiences where the mission of the organisation can” (HEART Trust/NTA (2015:10))
The articulation of the objectives reflects the understanding of the leadership of HEART/NTA Trust of promoting flexible and blended learning.

COL is also specifically referenced in the draft Open and Distance Learning Policy of the College of the Bahamas. Here specific reference is made to the COL Distance Education Quality Criteria (College of the Bahamas, 2015:4). The objective of their Policy is specifically:

"to increase access to all CoB/UB educational offerings for students presently underserved whether because of geography, price, entry qualification, or any other barrier. Increasing access to quality educational opportunities must always be the first metric by which success will be assessed."

Here they express the view that ODL can support their objective to increase access to quality educational opportunities (College of The Bahamas, 2015). This message was reinforced in an interview with Edward Bethel from the College of the Bahamas.

The draft ICT policy of St Vincent and the Grenadines Community College states that its main purpose is to ensure the effective protection and proper usage of their ICT system (SVGCC, 2015). Herd reviewed this policy and suggests that it tries to cover a range of services and address a number of challenges and that it requires further documented policies and procedures to support the ICT policy. He also indicates that both secondary students and teachers received laptops and smart phones and limited training has been provided on an ad hoc basis. He suggests further that the training will need to be more formalised and attention will need to be given to raising awareness about the use of these technologies among parents (Herd, 2015).

Thus, whilst COL has not explicitly supported policy development in many of its partner institutions and organisations in Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific, there appears to be a gravitation towards policy development in support of flexible ODL delivery, some of which has been under the influence of COL through conversations and the sharing of ideas and resources.

Policies related to ODFL and ICT seem still to be in draft form and it seems that the respective institutions require further support on related policies such as Acceptable and Fair Use policies and OER policies, as also suggested by Herd (2015). Similarly, with change in digital technologies being so rapid, new issues are also emerging that require policy direction. These include issues related to big data, MOOCs and learning analytics amongst others, and how these support and feed into emerging ODFL approaches. Here it is clear that policy and strategy development support is an important area for COL’s continued support and investment.

6.1.2 How has the learning experience been for teachers?

An analysis of the experience of teachers in INVEST over the past three years shows that teachers have been integrating digital technologies in their classroom practice and have been using flexible and blended learning approaches with their learners. This analysis also places many of the INVEST teachers in the Technological Literacy category of the UNESCO ICT Competency Framework although some may also be considered to be in the Knowledge Deepening category (Isaacs, 2015).
With reference to the other three regions, in 2014, the M&E process engaged with one teacher in Fiji in 2014 whose story is about the shift from a predominantly print-based face to face programme to one that is delivered as a distance and flexible learning programme enabled by a Moodle learning management system. This shift served to increase learner engagement, make the programme more inclusive and accessible and make the learning vocational and relevant for learners. The reason for the shift according to him, is to make the programme inclusive and accessible; to make the learning vocational and relevant for learners; and to increase learner engagement. He stated also that through distance and flexible learning (DFL) more opportunities to access learning to larger numbers of people were created; it became more cost effectiveness for students from countries outside of Fiji to participate; it opened up fun ways of learning; and access to the Internet opened up new possibilities for learners. He too experienced challenges with low response rate to Moodle by learners due to limited access to quality Internet connections and that learners involved in DFL needed to be self-motivated and some felt isolated which caused them to fall behind (Driu, 2014).

The 2014 M&E report also highlights the extent to which participants were able to start their own businesses following the training that they experienced at DAM in Bangladesh (Isaacs & Mead Richardson, 2014a). This was updated in 2015 to show that the new businesses that were started in 2014 were in fact sustained in 2015.

Another teacher in the Division of Arts Sciences and General Studies at SVGCC who had been trained in Moodle and flexible learning and Blackboard Collaborate in 2013-2014 provided a case study. She noticed that when PowerPoint and video was used in class, there would be much more engagement from learners. She would also flip her class by sending her learners videos to watch in their own time which would disadvantage students who did not have access to the Internet. She uses mainly Moodle to share lesson notes, slides and videos. She also uses Edomodo and email. As a French teacher she also encourages her learners to work with French language websites and YouTube.

She says that her learners have access to Smart phones and tablets and sometimes follow textbooks downloaded on their devices, in class. Sometimes after watching a video on YouTube, they would have lively debate and discussion in class on topical and locally relevant issues such as the Banana Wars in SVG and the Caribbean.

Her biggest challenges with integrating technologies in the classroom, would be the lack of projectors and problems with accessing SVGCC emails (Jacobs, 2015).

Similarly, the case study write up of Michelle Stewart-McKoy at UTech FELS, reveals a passionate teacher who uses a range of Web2.0 applications to support her teaching practice, as indicated above.

Herd (2015) found evidence of YouTube in use for Mathematics and Language learning and the use of free textbooks and PowerPoint by teachers, even though the design of their PowerPoint slides were weak.

Based on three individual case studies (in Fiji, Jamaica and SVG) and some insights shared by Herd (2015) on the actual use of digital technologies in support of FaB learning and teaching in classroom
practice, it seems that teachers in the Pacific and the Caribbean have begun the journey of adopting and integrating more recent Web 2.0 technologies in their practice, which also places them, as with INVEST teachers, both within and beyond the Technological Literacy category of the UNESCO ICT Competency Framework. In the case of METI, the Director indicated that at this stage, there was not much use of digital technologies in teaching and learning practice of their activities, however the Social Media training workshop of NGO representatives integrated these approaches within their workshop delivery practice. Similarly, the DAM training programmes also reportedly used digital technologies to a limited extent.

However the evidence base of teacher/facilitator integration of FaB approaches in their teaching practice and the learning experience of adult learners and workshop participants across the three regions, remain very limited at this stage to support generalizable conclusions. This could become an area of focused monitoring and evaluation in the coming period.

6.1.3 Which OER has the TVSD Initiative Produced?

Another important TVSD outcome is the production of courseware as OER. Here too, COL and its partners across the four regions produced 17 courses as OER which exceeds its target to produce 15 such courses by June 2016. They include:

- In Asia, DAM produced 5 OER skills training courses in Vermy Compost, Batik, Poultry Farming, Flower Cultivation and Nursery farming.
- INVEST Africa partners produced 6 OER courses in Manicure & pedicure, Brick-Making, Poultry Farming, Biogas development, Mobile Phone report and Educational Technology & Media for TVET teachers.
- In the Pacific, partners produced 3 courses in Community Development, additional audio content for a course in Vocational Literacy & Numeracy and another 2 courses in Horticulture and Permaculture.

The new online skills training courses developed in Jamaica are currently available for sharing within the government system in Jamaica but not yet outside the country. Negotiations are underway for HEART to make all their new courses available as OER to be used in the Caribbean region.

It is interesting to note that many partners are using OERs even if they are not yet producers of OER. An example would be Ginigoada Bisnis Foundation in PNG. They use COL OERs such as Learning About Small Business and adapt them for delivery in their non-formal skills training programmes. All eLearning training includes an introduction to OER and all teachers are encouraged to identify, evaluate and adapt existing OER materials for their own teaching content. This is happening in the INVEST partner institutions, at SVGCC and in some HEART institutions.

That COL has exceeded its outcome in co-producing OER with its partners and that it also takes it a step further to encourage and support the use of the OER through training programmes and encouraging their upload onto Moodle at institutional level to make them more accessible, reflects a commitment by COL to ensure that the materials add value to learning and teaching among its institutional partners.
6.2 EFFICIENCY: How cost-effective has INVEST Africa been?

COL’s TVSD Initiative spent CAD$1,258,279 on TVSD activities in all four regions from 1 July 2012 to 30 March 2015. This figure includes the costs of monitoring and evaluating the activities of the initiative. The Initiative partnered in varying degrees with a total of 64 institutions during this period. On average this translates crudely into an estimated CAD$19,661 per institution over three years. This average figure cannot be applied across the board to all institutions because COL not only invested more in some institutions relative to others over the three years but also only partnered with some institutions very recently relative to others who have been COL partners for a period beyond the three years covering this evaluation.

Again, as with the INVEST Africa programme, the question needs to be posed: Could more and better outcomes have been achieved per institution if each was given CAD$19,661 directly to invest in FAB and OFL capacity building activities? It is assumed that the wide range of expertise and networks that COL provides in its institutional capacity building programmes and activities provide a more cost effective and cost efficient way of promoting greater and more equitable access to quality skills development for citizens of the Commonwealth.

6.3 How RELEVANT is the TVSD Initiative for its partner institutions?

The relevance of the TVSD Initiative to the partner institutions and organisations across all four regions, is reflected by the initiative taken and leadership shown by COL’s partners to adopt ODFL in TVSD at various levels. A number of COL partners initiated policy and strategy development and sought COL support in their own locally-driven plans.

Because this phase of the evaluation did not engage directly with partner institutions in Asia, the Caribbean and the Pacific, and since relevance of the Initiative’s activities to COL Partners is best considered based on their views and experiences, these questions will be addressed in the next evaluation.

However, from the perspective of the COL ES, who engages directly with partners, the relevance of the Initiative, for its partners, is demonstrated by the fact that all partners indicate that they have strategic objectives to increase access through flexible and distance learning approaches. In turn their strategic objectives reflect national and regional policies, strategies and frameworks.

6.4 How SUSTAINABLE is the TVSD Initiative for COL Partners?

The partnerships developed over the past three years have built on relationships that had been established in the previous years. However, new partners have also been developed during the current triennium. This partnership development process has revealed that COL has tended to work mainly with partners who have demonstrated capability to own, support and manage the activities by themselves. COL’s role has consistently been to provide thought leadership, technical expertise, and limited resources to support course development, capacity building, and policy and strategy development in the main. The onus has been on partner institutions and organisations to take responsibility for follow up
activities related to cascading training, further implementation and maintenance. Often COL’s institutional and organisational partners have been able to leverage additional resources and partners based on foundational support work provided by COL. The work on life skills coaching with METI is a case in point where COL’s support helped strengthen their foundation to deliver this programme on a larger scale with USAID support. In this way, COL has been successful in discouraging dependency on COL resources and encouraging the promotion of self-sustainability among its partners.

6.5 GENDER EQUALITY: To what extent has TVSD Initiative promoted gender equality?

There were a few areas where the promotion of gender equality by COL surfaced prominently in the three regions outside of the INVEST Africa programme. The first was the role played by COL in supporting the training mainly of women by WITU to gain financial literacy and business skills and to start their own businesses. This three month course proved to be successful and empowering for women in business. An evaluation of the programme revealed success for the participants, who gained an increase in savings, in customers and in revenue and hence an improvement in their livelihood.

The second area reveals how shifting a course from a face to face mode to a flexible and distance learning model enabled greater participation of males, on programme that was historically almost exclusively female. Driu (2014) states that the gender composition of learners in Fiji and across the Pacific, changed from being predominantly female for fifty years, to the inclusion of male learners since shifting to the DFL mode.

The third area is that COL supported the development of staff capacity at VRDTA to develop a flexible course in livelihood skills for girls and young women who have dropped out of school and who are unemployed in Vanuatu. The experience and outcomes from this experience will be included in the next evaluation. The fourth area relates to the inclusion of gender neutral language in the development of skills in flexible and blended learning materials design among staff at FELS and HEART in Jamaica, by the consultant Sandy Hirtz (Hirtz, 2014b).

Developing non-formal courses to appeal to women and girls was discussed by the COL ES at the Pacific Regional Flexible TVET workshop, at the POMTECH and TVET FOL workshops in PNG and Kiribati.

In addition, Afamasaga covered gender sensitive writing with the METI Life Skills Coaches; the issue of gender sensitivity was raised by Marler and Koroivaca at VRDTCA and by Sayer at HEART where gender was addressed in a wider context of exclusion, including other groups who are commonly marginalised, for example, people with disabilities, older learners and people with low prior educational achievement. Two approaches were used to address the issue – looking at how to reduce barriers to access to the programme, and applying inclusive design principles, which help to ensure that courses are designed for all learners.

The fifth area related to the outcome of women improving their standard of living. The COL supported gender-sensitive skills training courses offered by DAM in Bangladesh attracted more women learners
(77%) and a higher percentage of the learners who developed new income generating activities with the skills were women (78%)

When taking the Africa region into account, the formation of 11 WITED Chapters; their related activities to raise awareness, provide role models, mentors, career guidance and provide bursaries for girls and women to pursue courses in male dominated sectors; and the workshop on gender mainstreaming hosted by COL for INVEST Institutional Champions; all reflect a commitment by COL to encourage TVET institutions to challenge gender biases.

The work of COL across the four regions reflect the integration to some extent, of a gendered approach in the capacity building programmes offered in partnership with COL. This remains a very important area for continued COL support and engagement. Here the plans to produce a gender equality toolkit for INVEST could also be extended to other regions and the more conscious programme activities, monitoring, evaluation and research on the gendered experience with ODFL will make an important contribution to shifting issues of gender from the margins to the centre of the changes in TVSD.

**6.6 LESSONS: What are the key lessons that COL has learned from the experiences of the overall TVSD Initiative so far?**

To date, the TVSD Initiative has accumulated important lessons across the four regions. Key among these is the importance of partnering with the ‘right’ institution at local level. Here ‘right’ refers to institutions who are ready to commit to, act on and sustain the changes that accompany the shift to ODFL and the integration of digital technologies. The Initiative has developed readiness tools to help COL ascertain whether partners are in a position to sustain the partnership.

An important part of the readiness process is the timing when the engagement with COL takes place. COL’s experience so far has also shown that institutions who were not ready two years ago may be more ready a year or two later. The Heart/NTA Trust is a good example of this.

Another important lesson for the coming six year planning phase of COL’s work is that COL chooses more strategically with institutions that are less ready to test a FaB model and more ready to support a scaled-up approach of national strategic value. Here the choice of expending more energy and budget on the promotion of country-wide programs such as in Kenya and possibly Jamaica, becomes an important consideration. COL has at this stage learned much about the FaB model during an experimental phase over the past five to six years and the following period could focus more on the implications of going to scale.

Linked to the scale up conversation is the need for COL to consider the institutions it can no longer continue to support because not much progress has been made over the past three years. This becomes an important choice in view of a limited budget as well. And in doing so, COL will have to consider appropriate ways to close the loop on the activities with institutions that fall within this category.
7. CONCLUSION

7.1 STRENGTHS
The strength of the Initiative continues to be the hands-on role played by the COL ES and the thought leadership role that she provides. Such a leadership role has included finding ways to stretch a limited budget and working very closely with institutional and organizational leaders and champions. She has also ensured that she has been able to conduct site visits to institutions to understand ways in which she and COL can provide further support.

Another strength is that where possible, COL has also been able to hire local consultants in some cases, to support its work in some areas. This contributes to keeping costs lower through avoiding flight costs and has proven to be very significant for local institutions and communities. Here the examples of consultants in Africa, India and Sri Lanka offer good examples.

Another important strength is that the TVSD Initiative has also made attempts to leverage internal partnerships with the cross-cutting eLearning Initiative at COL. This seems however to have happened more with INVEST Africa than the other regions.

Furthermore, COL’s focus on experiences in the informal sector and promoting gender equality and women’s empowerment are defining features, certainly of its INVEST programme and in Bangladesh. These appear to be less prevalent in the programmatic focus of work in the other regions, even though some institutions have had specific activities in this respect.

7.2 WEAKNESSES AND CHALLENGES
Whilst the programme clearly has many strengths, it is still confronted with the following inter-related challenges.

- Less knowledge sharing and collaboration across the four regions is a weakness of the Initiative.
- The sterling work done by COL in TVSD does not appear to be very widely known and has the potential for further awareness raising among other actors and stakeholders in the global TVET system and in this way, the prospects for further partnership and resource mobilization could open up.
- With a limited budget and limited human resource capacity at COL for the TVSD Initiative less time and money is available to leverage further resources and partnerships which can expand the work of COL.
- The Initiative relies on the provision of technical support via external consultants. With additional budget that can be used to leverage additional resources, the Initiative could spend more on supporting programmatic implementation.

8. RECOMMENDATIONS
Below are recommendations from both a programmatic and evaluation perspective.
8.1 RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO THE TVSD INITIATIVE

Inputs and Activities

The work of the TVSD Initiative in support of policy and strategy development on ODFL in TVSD has strategic value. COL’s TVSD Initiative has accumulated considerable experience in policy and strategy development on ODFL in TVSD for institutions and governments across the four regions in which it has been operating over the past two trienniums. It is recommended that COL maintains this advantage by continuing to support strategic institutions and countries on policy and strategy development because these create an enabling environment for the implementation of ODFL and guides the practice of ODFL in TVSD.

It is further recommended that COL encourages further collaboration and knowledge sharing in the policy and strategy development space across the four regions. Here the example of HEART/NTA Trust’s involvement in the CLN and drawing on the experience of INVEST Africa is worth highlighting.

COL has also played a leading thought leadership role globally in exploring models of ODFL and FAB learning approaches in TVSD. This is evident from COL’s prominence in Google searches on FaB and ODFL in TVET particularly in its four regions of focus. It is recommended that COL takes on more of a leadership role in this respect by catalysing deeper conversation and debate on the conceptual underpinnings of the FaB learning model and ODFL in TVET and how these enable the expansion in access to quality TVSD for all. COL has contributed to these conversations not only on FaB learning approaches but also on why TVET institutions need to expand the scope of their offerings to include the informal sector; on models of non-formal and informal learning and importantly too, on the need to challenge gender bias and gender stereotyping in TVSD and the importance of growing models of empowerment for girls and women in TVSD. This means that COL can play a leading role in convening key thought leaders, policy makers and practitioners to discuss and debate the critical issues in order to improve practice in ways that also draws on COL’s extensive concrete experiences in these areas. It also means conducting research beyond M&E on critical issues and publishing thought pieces that encourage debate. Another important area for further conversation and debate relates to appropriate policy models on ODFL in TVSD. This will also shift the conversation beyond the current focus on whether institutions or countries have a policy in place towards which policy models tend to be more successful and what the reasons are for their success or not.

It is also recommended that COL considers raising the profile of its work on TVSD at strategic global forums. Not only does this create awareness of COL’s experience but it also allows COL to leverage partnerships and resources to expand its work.

From a more practical perspective, it is also recommended that COL fosters stronger collaboration and synergies among its more strategic institutions in Kenya and Jamaica especially from the perspective of scaling up FaB approaches to TVSD at national level.
8.2 RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO IMPROVING THE M&E PROCESS

Whilst the M&E process has improved over the three year period, the limitations that have been documented repeatedly each year, can be overcome in ways that are also cost effective. An important advantage of this evaluation has been the reachability of the leadership of some of COL’s institutional and organisational partners and the value that the M&E process has gained from Skype interviews with them. It is recommended that in future, more such Skype interviews be planned and conducted with consultants, institutional heads and where possible, with teachers and organisational or institutional staff as well.

It is further recommended that for the next M&E process, further case studies be considered for a sample of teachers across all four regions and that tracer studies be conducted with learners, trainees and workshop participants as far as possible across the four regions.

Furthermore, ascertaining the extent to which the OER co-produced by COL are used to support learning and teaching by tracking the number of OER downloads from the websites of COL and its partners will also give further indication of the impact that this area of work is likely to have.

Attendance by the M&E Consultant at the Partners Meeting of the INVEST Africa Principals and Policymakers has proven to be invaluable. It is recommended that the M&E Consultant attend meetings where representatives from other regions also gather. Here COL’s Pan Commonwealth Forum may be best suited for face to face engagement with partners from other regions.
9. REFERENCES


College of the Bahamas (2015): Draft Policy with respect to Open and Distance Learning at the College of the Bahamas, College of the Bahamas

Commonwealth of Learning (2013a): Appendix I: Terms of Reference METI Samoa: Development of training materials for Life Skills Coaches


Commonwealth of Learning (2015): TVSD Teacher Case Studies, COL


Driu, A (2014): My experience in teaching Community Development (CD) program from a face to face(ftf) mode to a distance and flexible (DFL) mode, July 2014, COL

FELS (2015): Faculty of Education and Liberal Studies Status of FELS/COL Blended and Online Teaching as at February 1, 2015, FELS, UTech


Gipps TAFE consultants (2013) : Report on COL FOL Skills Development Workshop, Port Moresby, PNG, , 30 September – 11 October 2013, COL

HEART Trust/NTA (2015): Draft Flexible Learning Policy, Unedited/ Incomplete, HEART Trust, Jamaica


HEART Trust /NTA (2009): Distance Education, Strategic Plan 2009-2012

Herd G (2015): St Vincent & Grenadine Community College eLearning and eCollege Evaluation Visit, COL


Hirtz, S (2014b) Capacity Strengthening in Blended and Online Teaching, Workshop Report 5-9 May 2014, COL


Isaacs S & Mead Richardson (2014b) revised Monitoring and Evaluation framework for the TVSD Initiative February 2014, COL
Khan S (2014a): Capacity Building Workshop on Local Level Materials Development, FIVDB Sylhet, Organized by Dhaka Ahsania Mission In cooperation with Commonwealth of Learning (COL) and UNESCO Dhaka, 06-10 April 2014, COL
Karunanayaka, S (2015): Support to UNIVOTEC, Sri Lanka to complete the development of the online National Diploma in Technical Teacher Education (NDTTE) Course for University of Vocational Technology (UNIVOTEC), Sri Lanka, Progress Report, 10th – 16th January 2015, 16 January 2015, COL
Mead Richardson, A (2014d): St Vincent and the Grenadines, 12-14 February 2014, COL
Mead Richardson A (2014f): Tuvalu, 12-18 September 2014, Event Report, COL
Mead Richardson A (2014g): Solomon Islands, Pacific, 29 September to 3 October 2014, Event Report, COL
Marler T (2013): Support to Vanuatu Rural Development and Training Centres Association to build capacity in the design and development of a flexible course in the skills for livelihoods for girls in Vanuatu; for the Vanuatu Rural Development and Training Association, Workshop Report 2-9 October 2013, November 2013, COL
Office of Distance Learning (ODL) of the University of Technology (Utech) (2015): Data on the number of learners that have studied FELS online courses, UTech, Jamaica


Sayer B (2014b): Course design workshop for HEART National Training Agency, Jamaica, Workshop Report 8-13 June 2014, COL


St Vincent and the Grenadines (SVGCC) (2015): ICT Policy, SVGCC


University of South Pacific (2014): CEC31: Basic Concepts of Community Development, Centre for Vocational and Continuing Education, The University of the South Pacific, Suva, Fiji